

## Re: Homo & molluscs

---

*Source:* <http://sci.tech--archive.net/Archive/sci.anthropology.paleo/2005-09/msg00068.html>

---

- *From:* "Marc Verhaegen" <[fa204466@xxxxxxxxxx](mailto:fa204466@xxxxxxxxxx)>
  - *Date:* Mon, 5 Sep 2005 00:11:16 +0200
- 

"deowl" <[deowl@xxxxxxxxxxxxxx](mailto:deowl@xxxxxxxxxxxxxx)> wrote in message  
[news:4RkSe.7105\\$e47.6641@xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx](mailto:news:4RkSe.7105$e47.6641@xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx)

>

> "Jim McGinn" <[jimmcginn@xxxxxxxxxx](mailto:jimmcginn@xxxxxxxxxx)> wrote in message

> [news:1125731530.718164.185070@xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx](mailto:news:1125731530.718164.185070@xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx)

>

> Marc Verhaegen wrote:

>

>> So? Any reason why you think these animals could not have lived next to

>> "The sediments, numerous molluscan shells (Gyraulus chihliensis and

>> Planorbis youngi), and leaves and fruits of aquatic plants (for example

>> Trapa sp.) in MJG-III indicate a low-energy lakeshore or marsh

environment

>> rich in organic materials."?

>

> No reason at all Marc. Any reason that these highly

> mobile creatures might have lived at considerable

> distance from, "The sediments, numerous molluscan

> shells (Gyraulus chihliensis and Planorbis youngi),

> and leaves and fruits of aquatic plants."?

> Any reason at all?

>

>>> "Shallow water" the Nature report says. Yes, modern

>>> Hadza set up their hunting blinds near shallow water,

>>> but NEVER where they live. Their base camps are

>>> found 1-2 km away (O'Connell et al. 2002:850).

>>

>> Fine. And? Your point? We all know how modern Hadza live, but we're

>> talking

>> here about our ancestors 1, 2, 3... Ma. Anything in the Hazda's

lifestyle

>> that contradicts our scenario?

>

> Uh, Yes, as Lee stated above, modern Hadza set up

> their hunting blinds near shallow water, but NEVER

> where they live. Their base camps are found 1-2 km

> away (O'Connell et al. 2002:850).

So? Your point??

> And, as if that's not damning enough:

>

> "At Olduvai the Acheulean sites tend to lie along

> the former stream channels away from the playa

> lakes." Hay 1967a, 1976.

Old stuff. Again: if they had to write it again today, they had probably stressed the probability that the fossils were found near some lake... :-D

Etc.

.