

Re: Enjoying the Panis Quadragesimalis using modern imaging

Source: <http://sci.tech--archive.net/Archive/sci.astro.amateur/2008-01/msg00330.html>

- *From:* Quadibloc <jsavard@xxxxxxxxxx>
 - *Date:* Sun, 13 Jan 2008 10:28:45 -0800 (PST)
-

On Jan 13, 7:36 am, oriel36 <kelleher.ger...@xxxxxxxxxx> wrote:

The retrograde loops represent the Earth overtaking Mars using the same stellar background, again, as seen from an orbitally moving Earth –

Unfortunately a complete misinterpretation of the representation occurred via Newton who thought that placing the Sun at the center would cause the retrograde loops to disappear hence his awful approach to and resolution of retrogrades –

This is what I don't understand. If retrogrades are caused by the Earth overtaking Mars, then this means that Earth and Mars are both moving in the same direction around the Sun. And isn't that just exactly what Newton was saying?

I can only think that you dislike something in his wording, or his choice to explicitly use a heliocentric **perspective** to describe heliocentric **motion**. But I cannot comprehend why this would be considered valid.

Of course if the planets move around the Sun, these motions are most simply described in terms of how they look from a framework centered on the Sun – even if we then also must still show that this accounts for the same motions, which include real visible retrogrades, when seen from Earth. Which astronomers today do; no one denies that the planets appear to move in a retrograde direction in Earth's skies, and that it is because of Earth overtaking the outer planets is exactly what conventional astronomers currently realize. If you think they say otherwise, you have misunderstood them.

John Savard

.