

Re: Aaron Sloman's "The Irrelevance of Turing Machines to AI" article

Source: <http://sci.tech-archive.net/Archive/sci.cognitive/2004-08/0240.html>

From: Allan C Cybulskie (allan.c.cybulskie_at_yahoo.ca)

Date: 08/07/04

Date: Sat, 7 Aug 2004 07:37:04 -0400

BTW, I seem to have lost the last post you made to me before I could reply to it, so if you want something in it answered and can repost it that would be great.

"Wolf Kirchmeir" <wwolfkir@sympatico.ca> wrote in message news:haPPc.23036\$Vm1.458145@news20.bellglobal.com...

> *Sergio Navega wrote:*

> *But mostly, categorisation is language use. The question is, how do I get you to "understand" a new use of the language? How do I arrive at that new use? The first question is easier to answer than the second – I train you to use the language the same way I do, by, for example, "agreeing with what you say" in response to my speech. ***

This is an interesting view, but I think it's ultimately flawed. Think about teaching someone a new language. The first thing you do is start with simple words that you can relate to something they are already aware of. So you either teach them what the word means in terms of a shared, existing language, or terms of physical references to things really in the world. The "agreeing with what you say" part really only is the final cemented confirmation that understanding has been achieved, and it is unnecessary for learning. I can learn what a word means without anyone ever confirming my understanding. At that point, it's just the case that I THINK I know what it means, but I'm lacking the final confirmation of "Yes, that's right, that's what it means". But this isn't required to actually understand a new use of the language.

>

> *The second question is harder. Introspection and reports on "how I feel" suggest there are unpleasant feelings attached to certain language uses, and that these feelings may change to pleasant ones when a new use is produced. Euphemisms seems to work this way, for example. (That is, the discriminator in this case is a feeling. That feelings act as reinforcers should be obvious.)*

Certainly, feelings can act as reinforcers, but it would seem odd to say that you couldn't understand or learn