

## Re: Marriage is under fire!!

**Source:** <http://sci.tech-archive.net/Archive/sci.electronics.basics/2004-08/0863.html>

---

**From:** andy ([news4\\_at\\_earthsong.free-online.co.uk](mailto:news4_at_earthsong.free-online.co.uk))

**Date:** 08/16/04

Date: Tue, 17 Aug 2004 00:39:35 +0100

trying again.

On Mon, 16 Aug 2004 18:20:38 +0000, Kevin Aylward wrote:

> andy wrote:

>> On Mon, 16 Aug 2004 06:55:42 +0000, Kevin Aylward wrote:

>>

>>>> *It works by, whenever something is explained scientifically which was previously understood as magic, then it is no longer magic, and any earlier approaches to understanding that thing are relegated to 'primitive superstition'. Which is alright in a way, except for the way that until that happens, scientists have a tendency to invest far more energy than is really justified into rubbishing any competing explanations of things that they consider within their realm of understanding, simply because they draw on conceptual frameworks which don't easily fit the current scientific understanding of things.*

>>>>

>>>> *One example is asian medical traditions like acupuncture and shiatsu. I suffer from some mental health problems which are mostly around excessive fearfulness/paranoia. In chinese medicine, the emotion of fear is seen as related to the kidney meridian, which runs from the big toe up the inside of your legs, and then up the sides of the chest.*

>

> *There is no logic to this idea.*

What you mean is, you can't see how this idea makes sense in terms of your knowledge of human physiology. If that's not what you mean, then what do you mean?

> *Fear is an emotion evolved to achieve a*

> *certain function. i.e. make sure people take the appropriate action to*

> *maximise their interests in the face of danger. The idea that this*

> *"kidney meridian" has an effect on the brain is rather incredible.*

Why? I mentioned in another post that you can make some sense of this in western terms by talking about the release of adrenal hormones. Which do have an effect on the brain by shifting it into 'fight or flight' defensive mode. But as I said there, to then reduce the chinese concept to that and say – now we know what they were talking about, is throwing away a lot of other understanding they had which goes along with that concept. For example the way that the kidney meridian holds the heart meridian in check, so low kidney energy causes a flare up of heart energy. Which, as far as I can see is what happens when someone gets stoned on cannabis – this is known in chinese medicine to cause a reduction in kidney chi, but benefits stomach chi. Low kidney chi equals fearfulness/paranoia (a common side-effect). More stomach chi means you get the munchies (a common side effect). Heart chi is related to imagination and speech; hence stoned ramblings and flights of fancy.

- > *Sure,*
- > *maybe getting kicked in the kidneys might promote some response, but*
- > *there is no rational way a general relationship between fictitious*
- > *contours on the body and brain electrochemical responses can occur. It*
- > *just don't wash. Its simply stuff ignorant peasants dreamed up before*
- > *they had any idea of how the brain and body works.*

They did have an idea of how the brain and body works – they knew that it had among other things to do with the movement of various forms of chi through the body, and they found a (simple by our standards) theoretical language for describing this, and using it to treat sickness.

- >> *'Kidney chi weakness' is also the diagnosis*
- >>>> *I've had when I've been to see traditional chinese practitioners. One*
- >>>> *way to balance this out is simply to do exercises which involve*
- >>>> *stretching the inside leg muscles, and massaging the kidney area.*
- >>>> *I've tried this*
- >>>>
- >>>>
- >>> *Ahmmm...this is way to vague to make any conclusions.*
- >>
- >> *It's only one example out of a whole medical tradition.*
- >>
- >>>> *and it actually works for me,*
- >>>> *but because the theory behind these*
- >>>> *treatments is put in a conceptual framework which is foreign to*
- >>>> *western medicine, many scientists seem to want to rubbish that whole*
- >>>> *medical tradition just because it uses a language that makes no sense*
- >>>> *to them.*
- >>>>
- >>> *Its not because the language makes no sense, its because there isn't a*
- >>> *theory here at all.*
- >>
- >> *There is a theory*
- >
- > *Oh?*

- >
- >
- >> – *that human health is related to*
- >> *circulation/movement of an energy (bad word to use because of the*
- >> *western scientific connection) called chi,*
- >
- > *Indeed. The word "energy" is already taken. It is therefore pointless*
- > *using it to refer to something completely different.*
- >
- >> *that this takes different*
- >> *forms which are concentrated in a series of pathways called meridians,*
- >> *that the activation of these meridians varies in a cyclical way which*
- >> *is described by the five elements theory, that it is possible to*
- >> *diagnose energy imbalances using various methods, etc.*
- >
- > *This is simple waffle. "Mental" "problems" must be either due to "bad"*
- > *genes (brain hardware) or bad memes (brain software). That's all there*
- > *is, excluding magic.*

If you're feeling stressed and you take a bath to relax, then what does that have to do with either genes or memes?

- >> *It's just that most of the theoretical terms, and the signs and*
- >> *symptoms connected with them, can't easily be translated into western*
- >> *scientific terms.*
- >
- > *I doubt it. If this er... "theory" made any real sense*

now you're just being snide.

- >, *it could be*
- > *expressed in a more normal concise language. Usually obtuse terms and*
- > *vague ideas are just a cover up for lack of any real substance. Its done*
- > *all the tome by palm readers, tea leaf readers, astrologists etc.*

can be, but how is 'wave equation' not a vague idea to someone who doesn't know quantum physics?

I'll try an analogy. If there are half a dozen people in a room having a fierce argument, what's the best way of describing what is happening, or putting things right? You could run blood samples and electroencephalograms at short intervals on each of the people there, and try somehow to describe it in terms of levels of activation of various brain circuits, and maybe prescribe psychoactive drugs to the different people accordingly. Or you could say, john loves julie but thinks she's sleeping with fred, bill knows something about it but isn't saying, the cat's sat in the corner wondering when the humans are going to realise it's tea time, etc. I don't know how to sort things like that out – I'm crap at it. To me, the chinese medical approach is more like the second way – having a language for describing patterns of relationships between things, but that isn't the point, and it's a bit unfair on science to use

sci.electronics.basics: Re: Marriage is under fire!!

the analogy that way – the point is about different languages of description, and how it isn't always easy to translate between them.

--

<http://www.niftybits.ukfsn.org/>

remove 'n-u-l-l' to email me. html mail or attachments will go in the spam bin unless notified with [html] or [attachment] in the subject line.