



Re: I need some help from native speakers of Japanese

You've typed two identical sentences, so I don't quite get your question.

---

Sorry. This is the most important point.

Does Chomsky say "Where do you think that he has gone?" has the same meaning as "Where do you think he has gone?" has?

They are identical as far as the propositional meaning is concerned, despite some possible non-propositional difference between the two. In both, "where" can be interpreted either with the matrix clause or with the embedded one.

Or it seems that you want to study any little difference in the nuance between the two different English sentences translated into Japanese, doesn't it?

My first question is just a warm-up. I am more interested in the question I re-formulated in my previous post, the one involving the "because" clause.

Ray

Under the "cross-clausal movement process", does the following English sentence possible?

"Why do you think that he has gone?"

Yes, it's totally grammatical.

In fact, "why" can be construed not only with the embedded clause but also with the matrix one. A similar sentence made by H. Lasnik and M. Saito quoted in *An introduction to Government and Binding Theory* by Liliane Haegeman is "why do you think that he left early?" with "why" originating from the embedded clause.

Which of the following two meanings does this peculiar English sentence have?

Re: I need some help from native speakers of Japanese

Re: I need some help from native speakers of Japanese

- 1) "Tell me why he has gone, if you can."
- 2) "You think he has gone. Tell me the reason why you think so."

(I'm sure the sentence like "When do you think that he has gone?" would logically be nonsense.)

Both interpretations are available.

---

Really? Thank you.

---

B. Ito

cf. "Where  
do you  
think he has  
gone?"  
"Anata wa  
kare ga  
doko he itta  
to omoi  
masuka?"  
(Tell me  
where he  
has gone, if  
you know  
it.)

Is the sentence you've given grammatically correct and  
express what I  
have in mind?

---

As far as I know (or I've studied) English, the corresponding Japanese  
meaning would be correct.

Re: I need some help from native speakers of Japanese

Ray