

Re: I need some help from native speakers of Japanese

Source: <http://sci.tech-archive.net/Archive/sci.lang.japan/2006-05/msg00185.html>

- *From:* muchan <muchan@xxxxxxxxxxxxx>
 - *Date:* Fri, 05 May 2006 11:11:52 +0200
-

Bart Mathias wrote:

Ray wrote:

[...]

Now, there is a constraint in English Wh-question formation, to the effect that an element, e.g. an NP or otherwise, in an adverbial clause, be it causal, concessive or otherwise, cannot be moved out of it. This captures the ungrammaticality of the following sentence:

*Where do you think so because he went t?

This hardly takes a native speaker.

(kare-wa doko-e itta-kara) soo omou-no-desu-ka
(he-top where-to went-because) so think-that-is-int

is a perfectly understandable sentence (I'd prefer "kare-ga," but I'm sort of following Cindy here).

Bart

(first post canceled. This is second "editted" attempt to be more clear)

Sorry, but I would put '*' in front of this Japanese sentese...

* kare-wa doko-e itta-kara soo omou-no-desu-ka

* kare-ga doko-e itta-kara soo omou-no-desu-ka

Both, I read as asking :

"Is it the reason, that you think so?",

"Is the fact, that he went somewher, the reason, that you think so?",

and "doko/where" are quite out of place.

If you want ask "where", then it should be

kare-ga doko-e itta-to omoi-massu-ka.

and it ("Where do you think he went?") is not the meaning intended.

Re: I need some help from native speakers of Japanese

To ask:

1) you think so, 2) it's because he went somewhere, 3) and where is that somewhere.

anata-ga soo omou-no-wa, kare-ga doko-ni itta-kara-desuka.

I confess it's quite similar to your sentence I put '*', but "asking part" is -desuka, so yours is asking "omou-" or not.

(Now you can put analyse of my example, to please Ray, but I'm not interesting serving him/her.)

muchan

.