





Re: I need some help from native speakers of Japanese

understand like the matters over here.

Now it has gotten already very far to fix all the matters clear, and may I ask you if the following English expression would be acceptable to replace that incorrect English,

2. \*Where do you think that he was unhappy because he saw his enemy?

"Where do you think it is that he saw his enemy and became unhappy?"

Does Chomsky explain English grammar more complicated than what is called "Indirect Question" like undermentioned, deleting "because clause" from you new text.

I'm not quite sure of what you are asking. But I think Noam Chomsky's theory is highly abstract, more complicated than what I have written here and more opaque. And his theory is designed for human language in general. That's why I needed to compare different languages.

You can ask Bart whether formal syntax is easy stuff.

---

1. Where do you think that he has gone?

Does Chomsky allow to put "that" there as a conjunction?  
Or it is intentionally written there to show the original clause from which the "Where" comes, though this example English sentence is ungrammatical?

. "Does Mary think .....? + Where does Mary see John?"  
= Where does Mary think she saw John?

Re: I need some help from native speakers of Japanese

Re: I need some help from native speakers of Japanese

"Where does Mary think she saw John?" asks about Mary's idea about the location where she saw John.

Your topic here is that English expression more than this(with extra because clause) is impossible, isn't it? And Chomsky also says it is impossible, doesn't he?

I said that "where" cannot be moved out of a "because-clause" in English.  
Noam Chomsky and other syntacticians believe so, too.

And your conclusion here is that you need two sentences to express such context like "Mary thinks so because she saw John somewhere. So where does she think [she saw John t]?"but that one sentence would do in Japanese, isn't it? One sentence in Chinese, too ?

Yes, you need two sentences to express that idea.

"Where does she think [she saw John t] is correct in English.  
Its counterpart in Chinese is also correct.

Ray

---

The complicated sentence like your text 2 can't be composed into one English sentence but one Japanese sentence could be composed (and Chinese sentence, too?).

If this is your conclusion, one most important thing is cleared, isn't it?

---

B. Ito

---

B. Ito  
>>  
>> In Japanese one sentence would do: .....

Re: I need some help from native speakers of Japanese

Re: I need some help from native speakers of Japanese

>>

>> .....

>> B. Ito

>>