

## Re: Query: Use of WO where DE is expected.

---

*Source:* <http://sci.tech-archive.net/Archive/sci.lang.japan/2006-07/msg00347.html>

---

- *From:* Bart Mathias <[mathias@xxxxxxxxxx](mailto:mathias@xxxxxxxxxx)>
  - *Date:* Sat, 15 Jul 2006 08:42:08 -1000
- 

Ben Finney wrote:

mirror <<mailto:mirror@xxxxxxxxxx>> writes:

Hello,

In Jack Halperin's big kanji dictionary on page 30 for the entry I (as in `igai' and irai') is...

"Kogatana o motte korosu." (to kill [a person] with a knife)

This is an odd usage of the particle O. I would have expected DE here, since O seems to say "to kill a knife". Can anybody help me understand this idiom?

kogatana wo motsu -> kogatana wo motte korosu  
-> kogatana wo motte kuru  
-> kogatana wo motte kiru

I believe it's a mistake for sentence forms like this to be taught as

[[kogatana wo] [motte korosu]]

rather than

[[kogatana wo motte] korosu]

The latter is how I parse these structures, and it seems to fit just about all the example and real-use sentences I've encountered. It also makes it clear which particle should be used.

Yet time after time I see people learning "motte korosu" and a zillion other things as though they are distinct verbs -- and then, of course, you have to deal with the confusion of "oh, "kogatana" would normally take "de" but for this verb it needs "wo" instead" or some such, ad absurdum.

Re: Query: Use of WO where DE is expected.

The books I see \*encourage\* this, teaching "tsurete itte kureru" as some kind of new verb form with its own grammar, and then having to unwind the confusion of "for these particular forms you use "wo" instead of "ni", these other ones you use "de" instead of "ni".

Instead I just apply whatever rules go with the "suru" of "shite kureru", and specify "marumarū-san ni" to go with "kureru" if he's not already clear from context -- i.e., no new grammar required at all.

Is it me who's crazy?

Good question. You certainly seem to have found some crazy books that sane book users would find it easy to shun.

Bart

.