

Re: Can anyone translate English to Aramaic?

Source: <http://sci.tech-archive.net/Archive/sci.lang/2004-08/2864.html>

From: Peter T. Daniels (grammatim_at_worldnet.att.net)

Date: 08/23/04

Date: Mon, 23 Aug 2004 14:15:18 GMT

Fr. O'Malley wrote:

>
> *Peter T. Daniels wrote in message <4127C2E1.571@worldnet.att.net>...*
> > *Fr. O'Malley wrote:*
> >>
> >> *Dan,*
> >>
> >> *Ignore him. He seems to be just a prissy little troll. He can't*
> >> *translate it. Besides, he's neither a linguist nor a translator,*
> >> *just a linguist.*
> >
> > *What does "linguist" mean to you,*
>
> *One adept at speaking several languages, a polyglot.*

You and the US Army. But not the English language generally.

> *Certainly*
> *a specialist in the science of language, who may not necessarily*
> *be able to speak or write competently any language but his own*
> *should be called by a different name.*

Tough titties.

> > *and if you'll look me up at, say,*
> > *amazon, you'll find out how much of a translator I am.*
>
> *I've got a better idea. Why don't you post a translation of the*
> *phrase into every language you claim to translate? If you are*
> *indeed a Semiticist, post the translation at least into Hebrew*
> *and Arabic; Akkadian and Assyrian will be extra credit.*

Ok, write it in French or German and I'll translate it into English.

> >> *Word for word translation is seldom a good idea but has a*
> >> *time-honoured sanction in Biblical translation.*
> >
> > *We're not translating a Bible, we're translating some flaky New Agey*

sci.lang: Re: Can anyone translate English to Aramaic?

- > > *perversion of some quasi-Christian slogan.*
- >
- > "We" are not translating anything, evidently. And the gratuitous put-down
- > of Dan's phrase reveals your underbreeding. I can see why Dan
- > is the writer and you are the critic.

Ok, if you admire flaky New Agey writing. I suppose you snap up all the "Chicken Soup" books, and decorate your cell with Thomas Kinkadee paintings?

- > > > *I would suggest you contact a university department of*
- > > > *Biblical studies or perhaps even better, a google search*
- > > > *for Assyrians in the US should turn up several churches*
- > > > *whose clerics might oblige you by email. Perhaps*
- > >
- > > *Modern Assyrians are generally completely unfamiliar with any form of*
- > > *Aramaic but their own language and Classical Syriac, which is far from*
- > > *what you want here.*
- >
- > *You're missing the point. If you know Syriac, translate the*
- > *phrase. If you don't, why participate in the thread? Then again,*
- > *you seem to have enough time on your hands to participate ad*
- > *infinitum in _every_ thread, day after day after day.....*
- >
- > *Syriac is used in the Chaldaean rite, the Assyrian Church, and the*
- > *Syrian Orthodox Church. Any cleric in those traditions would know*
- > *it and it would provide a viable solution for the story.*

It was not, however, spoken in Palestine in the 1st century CE. If you don't know the difference between West Aramaic and East Aramaic, perhaps you shouldn't be trying to "help" at all.

- > > > *Mel Gibson might recommend someone. ; -)*
- > >
- > > *Yeah, Wm. Fulco S.J., who put Church Latin into the mouths of*
- > > *Greek-speakers.*
- >
- > *Who were the Greek speakers? I haven't seen it. I'm from the*
- > *old school which prefers Agamemnon butchered offstage.*
- > *Besides, it's only a movie.*

The people in the movie who don't speak Aramaic speak "Latin." But the people who lived in Palestine in the 1st c. CE didn't speak Latin, they spoke Greek. And I'm certainly not going to see the movie, either.

- > > > *Failing that, I am a bit rusty but I can offer this:*
- > > >
- > > > *Nur taw mo law chuinn ath-berfar dinih tofah o cholan as anam.*
- > > >
- > > > *This may not be grammatical Aramaic but is undoubtedly*
- > > > *very close to the language of the Lord. And it has the requisite*

Re: Can anyone translate English to Aramaic?

sci.lang: Re: Can anyone translate English to Aramaic?

> >> *gutturals for a nice Semitic flavor. You can use it in your
> >> story if you don't find something better. The only ones who
> >> will understand it are native Irish speakers anyway. ;-*)

> >

> > *Yes, Dan, it ain't Aramaic.*

>

> *Of course it isn't. I'm sure Dan picked up on the joke if you did.*

>

> *But I am at a loss why any specialist in Semitic languages of
> average competence could not translate so simple a sentence
> at least to the level Dan says he would be satisfactory. With
> a knowledge of Hebrew and Arabic and armed with a dictionary,
> one should be able concoct a serviceable translation.*

Ok, what's the Semitic for "chosen" [being sure to communicate the scare quotes]? For "rebaptized" or "reborn"? And why would knowledge of Hebrew and Arabic transfer to knowledge of Aramaic? Evidently you've never opened, say, Jastrow's dictionary, or tried to read a Talmud.

> *Even Fr. Fulco claimed only to have made an educated guess
> as to what the dialect of Aramaic at the time would have sounded like.
> Then again, Peter T. Daniels, I knew Fr. Fulco; you're no Fr. Fulco.*

And, considering what he did for money, I'm glad of it.

> >> *Good luck,*

> >>

> >> *Fr. O'Malley*

> >

> > *S.J.? or just B.S.?*

>

> *Not S.J.*

>

> *B. S. ? Bachelor of Science? Brothers of the Spirit?*

> *Bonaventurae Sodalitas? Beatissimorum Sanctorum?*

>

> *I pay you the courtesy of assuming you mean no disrespect.*

> *I forbear to assume you would wish to reveal yourself*

> *so unimaginative a boor.*

Ah, the non-Jesuitical insult. O.S.B.? or a canis Domini?

--

Peter T. Daniels

grammatim@att.net