

Re: Polynesian and South American place names

Source: <http://sci.tech-archive.net/Archive/sci.lang/2004-08/3974.html>

From: benlizross (*benlizro_at_ihug.co.nz*)

Date: 08/30/04

Date: Tue, 31 Aug 2004 01:11:23 +1200

Philip Deitiker wrote:

>
> *benlizross <benlizro@ihug.co.nz> says in*
> *news:413286CD.24F6@ihug.co.nz:*
>
> > *Nonsense. Random distortions can produce resemblance just*
> > *as much as non-resemblance.*
>
> *Since when is language random.*

Did I say "language is random"? Read again.

> *And if there is a genetic*
> *connection then you would also remove the random element.*

If that means anything, it sounds as if you're begging the question again.

> > *Like so many others, you seem not to have grasped the*
> > *concept of "chance resemblance".*
>
> *When did language become a random process?*

Read again above. It sounds like you have not even heard of chance resemblance.

> *Ross, I don't think you an I are going to see eye to eye on*
> *this. Since language evolves and is under selection it cannot be*
> *considered a random process, therefore you are wrong.*

A triple non-sequitur with back flip. What can I do but applaud?

I might be

> *wrong about the connection, but it would not anything*
> *specifically to do with your logic, since it is not applicable.*
> *Since you are wrong the point I made at the very beginning is*
> *something that is keenly applicable here, in your zealousness to*
> *disprove any longer range links your have thrown caution to the*

sci.lang: Re: Polynesian and South American place names

- > *wind, and your statements above seem to verify this.*
- > *The conclusion is this take caution because the similarities*
- > *may not be 'convergences' in the speaking pattern. Evolution of*
- > *language can sometime create similarly pronounced words;*

Wait! Hold that thought! You may have just discovered chance resemblance!

however

- > *I picked about >1/2 of the name places and showed they could*
- > *easily fit into the Japanese named place repertoire (not*
- > *implying that these words came from Japan) so this is not a*
- > *simple instance of a couple 'random' events.*

No, it's an example of a dozen or so random events. After you've discovered chance resemblance, the next thing to discover is how common it is. Check out the discussion with Yuri for the url of a lovely world gazetteer which will find multiple instances of the same place name all over the world.

Yes, it is

- > *potentially true that there is convergence in spoken language*
- > *style.*
- >
- > *Anyway, I think I have seen your prejudice here clearly enough*
- > *we don't have to continue the conversation further.*

As you wish, but I don't know what you think is my "prejudice". Surely you're not going all Yuranoid and thinking I'm "prejudiced against Native Americans" or something?

Ross Clark

[Put sci.lang back in followups]