

Re: turkey/peru/portuguese

Source: <http://sci.tech-archive.net/Archive/sci.lang/2004-09/0880.html>

From: Douglas G. Kilday (*fufluns_at_chorus.net*)

Date: 09/07/04

Date: Tue, 7 Sep 2004 02:04:50 -0000

"Peter T. Daniels" <grammatim@worldnet.att.net> wrote ...

> *Douglas G. Kilday wrote:*

>

>> *The really interesting matter is the unshifted /p/ in Low German, for which*

>> *I can think of two explanations. One is Hans Kuhn's Nordwestblock, the presumed group of IE-speakers located between Celts and Germans, with neither the Celtic loss of initial /p/ nor the Germanic consonant-shift.*

>> *The other is borrowing from Vulgar Latin. Some scholars scoff at the Nordwestblock, but it provides the only plausible etymology I have seen*

>

> *Then I trust you won't scoff at Hamp's "Hellenic" and "Cimmerian" IE substrata in Greek and Slavic respectively.*

I'm certainly not scoffing at his "Cimmerian", which I know nothing about, but I think the derivation of <Thúle:> from the IE root *tel- found in L. <tellus>, OIr <talam>, etc. is unwarranted, and the explanation of <I:talia> as 'This Land' with the demonstrative *i- prefixed to the same root *tel- is unconvincing. (Then again, Woody Guthrie's heirs would probably not scoff.)