

# Re: The Tally–Ho! Theory of Language Origins

---

*Source:* <http://sci.tech–archive.net/Archive/sci.lang/2005–10/msg00263.html>

---

- *From:* [hrrubin@xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx](mailto:hrrubin@xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx) (Herman Rubin)
  - *Date:* 6 Oct 2005 11:48:57 –0500
- 

In article <434454A9.5943@xxxxxxxxxx>, benlizross <benlizro@xxxxxxxxxx> wrote:  
>Peter T. Daniels wrote:

>> benlizross wrote:

>> > rogerprince@xxxxxxxx wrote:

>> > > benlizross wrote:

.....

>> > Actually, my remarks were addressed to Dr Jamshid Ibrahim, who  
>> > elaborated on your one line. But I suspected that your "in a sense"  
>> > might conceal an escape hatch. So, like Derrida, you say "Writing  
>> > precedes speech", which looks startling and original, but turns out to  
>> > be based on using the term "writing" in a sense that nobody else uses  
>> > it. In your case "writing" = "animal tracks". What's the point?

>> I thought he was saying that the pre–humans would make marks on the  
>> ground in imitation of the tracks of their prey, so as to teach their  
>> fellows what to look for.

>> That would be vaguely writing–like, but still not a useful extension of  
>> the term.

>And would this teaching be done without speech?

I do not believe this preceded some form of speech, which is also present in other animals. But it can be done by pointing, and possibly drawing pictures of the prey.

I am not convinced that, even with less flexibility, this is not done by Arctic predators teaching their cubs how to follow tracks of prey animals. I would be reluctant to say that this cannot be taught without language; we have much animal behavior which is taught.

—

Re: The Tally–Ho! Theory of Language Origins

This address is for information only. I do not claim that these views are those of the Statistics Department or of Purdue University.

Herman Rubin, Department of Statistics, Purdue University

hrubin@xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx Phone: (765)494–6054 FAX: (765)494–0558

.

---

• **References:**

◆ **Re: The Tally–Ho! Theory of Language Origins**

◇ From: benlizross

◆ **Re: The Tally–Ho! Theory of Language Origins**

◇ From: Peter T. Daniels

◆ **Re: The Tally–Ho! Theory of Language Origins**

◇ From: benlizross

• Prev by Date: **Re: Hebrew and Tradition – who is right**

• Next by Date: **Re: Spelling rules in old languages**

• Previous by thread: **Re: The Tally–Ho! Theory of Language Origins**

• Next by thread: **Re: The Tally–Ho! Theory of Language Origins**

• Index(es):

◆ **Date**

◆ **Thread**