

## Re: So it is true...

---

*Source:* <http://sci.tech--archive.net/Archive/sci.lang/2005-12/msg00561.html>

---

- *From:* "Seán O'Leathlóbhair" <jwlawler@xxxxxxxxxx>
  - *Date:* 6 Dec 2005 02:31:55 -0800
- 

Dik T. Winter wrote:

> In article <439455EE.5FB5@xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx> "Peter T. Daniels" <grammatim@xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx> writes:

>> Seán O'Leathlóbhair wrote:

>>> Dik T. Winter wrote:

>>>> In article <1133777483.827286.191030@xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx>

"=?iso-8859-1?B?U2XhbiBPJ0x1YXRobPNiaGFpGcg==?=" <jwlawler@xxxxxxxxxx> writes:

>>>> ...

>>>>> Some parents may want one

>>>>> to help explain Harry Potter to their children. "Dad, what's a

>>>>> lorry?", "Don't know son, some limey thing".

>>>>>

>>>>> Only if they read the UK edition, which is unlikely. The books have been

>>>>> translated to US English.

>>>>>

>>>> I know that the first book was translated and this seemed

>>>> controversial. I remember a long thread on the subject (probably in

>>>> alt.english.usage). If I remember correctly, the majority opinion from

>>>> both sides of the Atlantic was that the translation was excessive.

>>>>

>>> It allegedly went beyond translation to revision. In particular,

>>> changing "Philosopher's Stone" to "Sorcerer's Stone" is especially

>>> egregious.

>>

> What I found most egregious was the introduction of a person in the

> American edition that was not present in the British edition. Dean

> Thomas, who was black. And more so because the introduction made

> surrounding text incorrect. To quote:

> And now there were only three people left to be sorted.

> <inserted text>

> "Thomas, Dean," a Black boy even taller than Ron, joined Harry at the

> Gryffindor table.

> </inserted text>

> and after that follow "Turpin, Lisa", "Weasley, Ron" and "Zabini, Blaise".

> Can't count to four?

Dean Thomas sounds a familiar name. Are you sure that he is not in the UK edition? He may just have been added to this scene. I don't recall

Re: So it is true...

any explicit mention of skin colour in the UK editions, I would expect that this was deliberate. Some characters have names which suggest that they are not white but I don't think that this is confirmed in the text. I will try to find some time in the next few days to check. I also have the first book in French and Spanish, I will see how they treat this scene. The American editors may have felt the need to confirm that there are some black pupils. I would guess that the author deliberately left this unclear, the reader can imagine as many, or as few, black pupils as he wishes. If you label one as black then it may suggest that all the others are white. If you never mention skin colour then any proportion of black pupils is possible.

>> More of a concern, though, is that they have celebrations of "Christmas"  
>> and "Easter" with no other indication that they are a Christian  
>> society/institution.  
>  
> Howsat? I have also celebrations of Christmas and Easter, but I am not  
> Christian at all. In Europe celebrations of Christmas and Easter are  
> quite common but are (in general) disconnected from the Christian  
> beliefs. And I think that is also true in the US.

It is certainly like that here.

> --  
> dik t. winter, cwi, kruislaan 413, 1098 sj amsterdam, nederland, +31205924131  
> home: bovenover 215, 1025 jn amsterdam, nederland; <http://www.cwi.nl/~dik/>

--

Seán O'Leathlóbhair

---

• *Follow-Ups:*

- ◆ **Re: So it is true...**  
    ◇ *From:* Peter T. Daniels
- ◆ **Re: So it is true...**  
    ◇ *From:* Dik T. Winter

• *References:*

- ◆ **Re: So it is true...**  
    ◇ *From:* Dik T. Winter
- ◆ **Re: So it is true...**  
    ◇ *From:* Seán O'Leathlóbhair
- ◆ **Re: So it is true...**  
    ◇ *From:* Peter T. Daniels
- ◆ **Re: So it is true...**  
    ◇ *From:* Dik T. Winter

- Prev by Date: **Re: Be and Have in Hebrew, and ACC case**

Re: So it is true...

Re: So it is true...

- Next by Date: ***Re: Is there an optimal sequence for language acquisition?***
- Previous by thread: ***Re: So it is true...***
- Next by thread: ***Re: So it is true...***
- Index(es):
  - ◆ ***Date***
  - ◆ ***Thread***