

# Re: I need help explaining basic linguistic concepts to a lay person

---

*Source:* <http://sci.tech-archive.net/Archive/sci.lang/2006-01/msg02309.html>

---

- *From:* "Paul J Kriha" <[paul.nospam.kriha@xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx](mailto:paul.nospam.kriha@xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx)>
  - *Date:* Mon, 23 Jan 2006 18:05:00 +1300
- 

Heidi Graw <[heidigraw@xxxxxxx](mailto:heidigraw@xxxxxxx)> wrote in message [news:jsYAf.427940\\$ki.264262@xxxxxxxxxxx](mailto:news:jsYAf.427940$ki.264262@xxxxxxxxxxx)

>

>>"Jayne Kulikauskas" <[jayne.kulikauskas@xxxxxxx](mailto:jayne.kulikauskas@xxxxxxx)> wrote in message

>>[news:1137987788.170607.299460@xx](mailto:news:1137987788.170607.299460@xx)

>>

>> Heidi Graw wrote:

>>>>[jayne.kulikauskas@xxxxxxx](mailto:jayne.kulikauskas@xxxxxxx)> wrote in message

>>>>[news:1137980126.008295.147440@xx](mailto:news:1137980126.008295.147440@xx)

>>>>

>>>> Franz Gnaedinger wrote:

>>>>

>>>> [...]

>>>>> Something else entirely – can you give me an example

>>>>> of a word that turned into something else entirely?

>>>>

>>>> Jayne wrote:

>>>> danish, hamburger, wiener, frankfurter

>

>>>Heidi wrote:

>>> Those words have merely had \*additional\* meanings being added to them.

>>> To

>>> be Danish still means to be Danish. A Danish can also be a pastry.

>

>> Jayne wrote:

>> I suppose your point is valid for this example, but I don't think it is

>> for the others.

>>

>

>>>Heidi wrote:

>>>That

>>> Hamburger can still be a person born in Hamburg, but it is also a meat

>>> patty

>>> on a bun. Wiener waltzes are not hot dog waltzes. A Frankfurter is

>>> still a

>>> person born in Frankfurt, but he's no sausage.

>> [...]

>

Re: I need help explaining basic linguistic concepts to a lay person

>> Jayne wrote:

>> I think you are aware of the original meanings because you are a German  
>> speaker.

>

> When JFK claimed, "Ich bin ein Berliner!" I think he was well aware he was  
> not referring to a pastry or meat patty.

Jayne was talking about common usage of words in English language. Surely, you agree that the sentence "Ich bin ein Berliner!" wasn't meant to be English.

>> I suspect that most monolingual native speakers of English

>> don't have those meanings in their vocabularies.

>

> No, but just because they don't know other languages doesn't mean those  
> meanings are irrelevant.

That's exactly what it means. When you speak a language No.1, incidental meanings of the identical or similar words in languages No.2 to No.6,000 (or whatever) are utterly irrelevant.

> German, Dutch and Danish are still very much  
> living languages which millions of people speak.

>

>> I have never heard a  
>> native speaker say "Wiener waltz"

>

> My Canadian friends who are interested in Classical music are very much  
> aware what it means to listen and dance to Wiener waltzes.

Even if that were relevant, they'd dance to Wiener waltzes not wiener waltzes.

Would the English vocabulary of your Canadian friends also include names of other equally popular dances of the same era from the same Austrian empire, such as csardas, kolo, or polka?

If foreign language words and expressions are included in somebody's English vocabulary it does not mean they automatically become English language words.

pjk

>> or use Frankfurter or Hamburger to

>> refer to residents of those cities.

>

> It depends on their education, wouldn't it? Those Canadians who know cities  
> named Frankfurt and Hamburg exist, would know what Frankfurter and Hamburger

Re: I need help explaining basic linguistic concepts to a lay person

Re: I need help explaining basic linguistic concepts to a lay person

- > means.
- >
- > Of course it is entirely possible that Ontario doesn't teach children
- > anything about Europe? In BC they get a pretty good education. World
- > geography is part of the curriculum.
- >
- > However, I can understand why you would think not many English speakers
- > would be aware of the additional meanings for the words to offered. You
- > hang around homeschoolers and do homeschooling yourself! You have no idea
- > what is being taught in public school.
- >
- > Heidi

---

• ***Follow-Ups:***

- ◆ ***Re: I need help explaining basic linguistic concepts to a lay person***  
◇ *From:* Heidi Graw

• ***References:***

- ◆ ***Re: I need help explaining basic linguistic concepts to a lay person***  
◇ *From:* Jayne Kulikauskas
- ◆ ***Re: I need help explaining basic linguistic concepts to a lay person***  
◇ *From:* Heidi Graw

- Prev by Date: ***Re: Tehran/Mehran***
- Next by Date: ***Re: Tehran/Mehran***
- Previous by thread: ***Re: I need help explaining basic linguistic concepts to a lay person***
- Next by thread: ***Re: I need help explaining basic linguistic concepts to a lay person***
- Index(es):
  - ◆ ***Date***
  - ◆ ***Thread***