

Re: Etymology of "Ketzer"

Source: <http://sci.tech-archive.net/Archive/sci.lang/2006-06/msg00252.html>

- *From:* me <noreply@xxxxxxxxxxxx>
 - *Date:* Mon, 05 Jun 2006 16:54:40 -0500
-

John Atkinson wrote:

"Neeraj Mathur" <neemathur@xxxxxxxxxxxx> wrote...

If you want to check the evidence for how Dravidianists reconstruct 'mi:n' as 'star' for Proto-Dravidian

Krishnamurti ("The Dravidian Languages") reconstructs it as 'miHn' (where 'H' is a laryngeal that he's rather fond of), related to 'min-', to shine or sparkle (DED 4876).

[mInUNNU] and [mInUkkU] are passive and active verbs for shine in Malayalam.

'Fish' is 'mi:n' (DED 4885).

I've come across at least one archaic Tamil word using the morpheme mi:n, with a meaning similar to star. The word isn't mi:n but includes the morpheme mi:n in its entirety and the word means "luminous celestial object". Unfortunately, I can't remember what the word is; I once looked up its meaning.

and then challenge it, go ahead; I'm not committed to that etymology myself (since I don't know the evidence) and am open to hearing a proper discussion. But simply saying that it's not the word for 'star' in two modern Dravidian languages does not make the argument for you. (My hunch is that the reconstruction will be based on Old Tamil – do you know that language as well?)

In order to be reconstructed for proto-Dravidian (which they have been), these words would have to have cognates in other languages as well — including at least one of the Central or North Dravidian languages. (The old literary languages, Tamil, Malayalam, Kannada, and Telegu all belong

Re: Etymology of "Ketzer"

to the South Dravidian branch.).

If the Harappa civilization language spoke a Dravidian language, geography would suggest that it belonged to the North Dravidian branch. That is, provided proto-Dravidian had already split up by this time. The fact that proto-Dravidian contained words for 'king', 'palace', 'fort', 'tax', 'slave', and lots of agricultural terms (but not 'wheel') suggests that it didn't start splitting until after civilization got started in India.

John.