

Re: Ranning away and fearing: IE BELGON basis

Source: <http://sci.tech-archive.net/Archive/sci.lang/2006-12/msg02559.html>

- *From:* Harlan Messinger <hmessinger.removethis@xxxxxxxxxxx>
 - *Date:* Thu, 21 Dec 2006 15:15:31 -0500
-

Dusan Vukotic wrote:

Harlan Messinger wrote:

Dusan Vukotic wrote:

Harlan Messinger wrote:

The point you keep missing is that every single pair of words with a mutual resemblance is not necessarily related. In fact, it would be a statistical anomaly if, given the limited phonetic range available, there *weren't* thousands of pairs of words among various languages that had superficial phonetic and semantic resemblances. And when one plays the kind of game you do, a sort of etymological Six Degrees of Kevin Bacon, where you feel free to create arbitrarily long sequences of concepts in which any two neighboring concepts are similar but the concepts on both ends may be completely unrelated, you're bound to turn up false positives in abundance.

They are the same morphologically and semantically they

have almost the same meaning.

Are you serious! You are following Kevin's six degrees crap? I thought we were discussing science and not belief in magical spells,

Re: Ranning away and fearing: IE BELGON basis

ocult
forces and evil spirits!

Was I that unclear? I was characterizing what *you* do as resembling a game of Six Degrees of Kevin Bacon.

You were clear and it is the reason why I think you must be some kind of joker. We are talking about the words from the same branch (both Serbian and English are IE languages or I might be wrong?).

"Day" and Spanish "día" are from IE and the have nothing to do with each other. "Bad" and Persian "bad", which means "bad", are both from IE and have nothing to do with each other. For the umpteenth time, similarity in both phonetics and semantics aren't sufficient, *especially* when you craft rather long strings of concepts together to make two words *look* like they're semantically similar, as you do time and time again.

Do you not
you see, you are talking about the chance resemblances among brothers
and sisters!

Yes, it happens! It happens! All the time! Even in the *same* language, not every pair of words with similar sounds and meanings are related! Really! It's a fact! So you can come up with these similarities until you turn blue, but until you can find a meaningful pattern, and reduce the amount of arbitrariness that you admit in finding "similarities" between meanings, you won't have anything sufficiently solid to find interesting.