

## Re: Substitutes for English /T/ and /D/

---

*Source:* <http://sci.tech--archive.net/Archive/sci.lang/2007-07/msg01105.html>

---

- *From:* "Peter T. Daniels" <[grammatim@xxxxxxxxxxxx](mailto:grammatim@xxxxxxxxxxxx)>
  - *Date:* Mon, 23 Jul 2007 05:55:43 -0700
- 

On Jul 22, 7:13 pm, Dominic Bojarski <[dominicbojar...@xxxxxxxxxx](mailto:dominicbojar...@xxxxxxxxxx)> wrote:

On Jul 22, 11:39 pm, "Peter T. Daniels" <[gramma...@xxxxxxxxxxxx](mailto:gramma...@xxxxxxxxxxxx)> wrote:

On Jul 22, 1:48 pm, Dominic Bojarski <[dominicbojar...@xxxxxxxxxx](mailto:dominicbojar...@xxxxxxxxxx)> wrote:

Where did you get the idea that there's a later portion of a sound "that English speakers depend on for recognition"?  
From listening to Poles and noticing that they clip particular sounds

very short to the point that I can't recognize it. Final m and n become merged with the vowel to give a nasalized vowel, and final l is hardly audible at all or is merged with the vowel to form a diphthong followed by the slightest trace of an l.

What's that got to do with some illusory "final portion" of the consonant not being articulated?

Ruud is given to flights of fancy, and most of his observation of phonetics apparently comes from songs, from which you can tell little about the duration of spoken segments.

Ruud has nothing to do with this.

You accepted his confirmation of your wacky theory of long consonants with non-significant followed by significant portions.

Are you saying he can't pronounce the difference between THIRty and

Re: Substitutes for English /T/ and /D/

thirTEEN?

I pronounce both with the accent on the first syllable. The problem is not the stress.

In all contexts?? Then your command of English is, shall we say, not mainstream.

Why you hate lower-class Englishmen.

Beg your pardon? Put the bottle down, Peter. I've said precious little about Cockney in this thread at all, and nothing that could be construed as hateful.

You have an irrational hatred for the [f v] substitution; you have offered no explanation; I found a reasonable one.

Then why don't you teach your students to make the English sounds in the first place, rather than telling them to make one inappropriate substitution rather than another?

Because I'm not teaching them "in the first place". The students I teach already have ingrained bad habits from previous teachers, Poles themselves, who failed to correct the pronunciation, often because they had pronunciation problems themselves. It takes a great deal of time for Poles to learn how to pronounce [T D], and it's a lot easier to do if they are starting with POLISH [t d] than with [f v].

Then you need to take the time and exert the effort.

You just said you grew up in a Polish-speaking community [in the US]. How did you manage to not learn the language as an infant?

You know precious little about language transmission in immigrant communities.

The last immigrants came to my town in about 1920. After that point, there was no influx of immigrants at all except an occasional priest.

Then it wasn't a "Polish-speaking community," was it. One of my best

Re: Substitutes for English /T/ and /D/

friends in Chicago was the son of immigrants who never got more than a few words of English. He spoke only Polish until he entered school (at, I suppose, the age of 4 or 5) and interpreted for his parents when necessary. (His English was perfect too, of course.) His father, though, was able to ask me to be a pall-bearer at his funeral (AIDS was different in those days — he was not yet 30).

Few of the immigrants learned English beyond the basic conversational level. My grandmother never learned English beyond the elementary level even after seventy-five years of living in the States, in spite of the fact that she lived with seven monolingual grandchildren. She was quite satisfied with the level he reached. Many immigrants never learned English at all beyond a few phrases that they could use in fixed ...

[read more »](#)—

The sad story of grandchildren of immigrants is ubiquitous. My father's parents died long before I was born (there's no indication that he ever had a word of Ukrainian or Polish), and my mother's parents were born in Brooklyn, so I never had a linguistic heritage to be cut off from.