

Re: "experiment" Re: Waradpande seems to have destroyed PIE already

## Re: "experiment" Re: Waradpande seems to have destroyed PIE already

---

*Source:* <http://sci.tech-archive.net/Archive/sci.lang/2007-12/msg00144.html>

---

- *From:* "Peter T. Daniels" <[grammatim@xxxxxxxxxxxxx](mailto:grammatim@xxxxxxxxxxxxx)>
  - *Date:* Mon, 3 Dec 2007 09:02:30 -0800 (PST)
- 

On Dec 3, 11:08 am, Franz Gnaedinger <[f...@xxxxxxxxxxxxx](mailto:f...@xxxxxxxxxxxxx)> wrote:

On Dec 3, 4:48 pm, "Peter T. Daniels" <[gramma...@xxxxxxxxxxxxx](mailto:gramma...@xxxxxxxxxxxxx)> wrote:

An experiment is when one (a scientist, generally) tests a hypothesis by setting up some controlled environment of interest, varying the parameters (one at a time, ideally) by controlled increments, and observing the results. With a good hypothesis, the results will conform to expectations. With an inadequate hypothesis, they won't, and the hypothesis will need revising or replacing (and science will have been done).

Peter, for heavens sake: a production editor at Gorgias

How dare you associate me with that charnel-house of a "publisher."

should know that one absolutely can't give a definition in the form of: X is when ...

Why not? That's what we were told in elementary school, but later on it was pointed out that there's nothing whatsoever ungrammatical or uninterpretable about the construction, and it is in common, everyday use.

And then you make the mistake of describing one specific sort of experiments. If you go from practice to definition, you should mention different kinds of experiments, and then find what they have in common, thus arriving at a true definition.

Re: "experiment" Re: Waradpande seems to have destroyed PIE already

What are some other "kinds of experiments"? In particular, what are some "experiments" that resemble your fantasies about "Magdalenian"?

When Tolkien invented languages, and then invented a civilization for them to be spoken in, was he "experimenting"? What were the results of the "experiments"?

.