

Re: Beheaded Accipiter

Source: <http://sci.tech--archive.net/Archive/sci.lang/2008-08/msg00922.html>

- *From:* Dunaan Vukoti <dusan.vukotic@xxxxxxxxxx>
 - *Date:* Wed, 20 Aug 2008 04:19:35 -0700 (PDT)
-

On Aug 20, 12:28 pm, Harlan Messinger
<hmessinger.removet...@xxxxxxxxxxxxx> wrote:

Du¹an Vukotiæ wrote:

On Aug 19, 10:27 pm, Harlan Messinger
<hmessinger.removet...@xxxxxxxxxxxxx> wrote:

Harlan Messinger wrote:

Du¹an Vukotiæ wrote:

On Aug 18, 11:03 pm,
Harlan Messinger
<hmessinger.removet...@xxxxxxxxxxxxx>
wrote:

It has
nothing to
do with
qualifications.
You
AREN'T
providing
any kind of
scientific
evidence.
One more
time: a
bunch of
words

The same "bunch of words"
is proposed by Pokorny and
many other
scholars. Something must
be terrible wrong with your
ability
of sound reasoning. It

Re: Beheaded Accipiter

seems, you are always
judging ad
hominem!

Context, please. Did he simply list all these words and then claim that this proved that they were all related? Because as far as I know he or others provided a rigorous demonstration elsewhere, and the list below was given merely as a digest of the *outcome* of that demonstration.

Never mind, I found an online source for the material you quoted:

<http://www.geocities.com/aljecipuri/etymology5>

The material is from his Indogermanisches Etymologisches Wörterbuch. It isn't a study designed to *support* relationships claimed among words in various branches of PIE, it's a compendium of the *conclusions* of such study. If I wanted to know *how* he arrived at these conclusions, I would look elsewhere. With your lists, there is no "elsewhere"—you just generate lists and imagine that they stand on their own. And now I find out that you thought that you were only doing what Pokorny was doing. Well, you misunderstood what Pokorny was doing.— Hide quoted text —

— Show quoted text —

I see that your command of German is insufficient: On the other hand, you are unfamiliar with the Slavic languages. I wonder what your knowledge level of Greek and Latin may be?

Re: Beheaded Accipiter

Now I understand your anxiety to enter into a more substantial debate
;-)

I've shown anxiety? What are you talking about? I haven't been the least
bit shy about telling you over and over that substance is something that
your hodgepodes of words can't be accused of possessing.– Hide quoted text –

– Show quoted text –

Your poor knowledge of Slavic and Germanic (English could hardly be
classified as a representative of Germanic) disqualifies you from any
serious discussion on the matter of language development, even in case
if your Greek and Latin aren't so bad.

DV

.