

# Re: free variables in FOL

---

*Source:* <http://sci.tech-archive.net/Archive/sci.logic/2005-06/msg00281.html>

---

- *From:* William Elliot <[marsh@xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx](mailto:marsh@xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx)>
  - *Date:* Fri, 17 Jun 2005 15:23:46 -0700
- 

On Fri, 17 Jun 2005, Ken Quirici wrote:

> Jim Spriggs wrote:

>>

>> Consider this rule

>>

>> from  $F(x) \Rightarrow G$

>> deduce  $(\forall x)F(x) \Rightarrow G$

>>

$(\forall x)(F(x) \rightarrow G)$

$(\forall x)F(x) \rightarrow (\forall x)G$

$(\forall x)G \rightarrow G$

$(\forall x)F(x) \rightarrow G$

>> Can you find a counter example?

>

No.

> Universe of discourse:

>

> set of integers I

>

>  $F(x)$ : x is divisible by 5

>

>  $G$ : there are primes divisible by 5

>

> then clearly  $F(x) \Rightarrow G$  for  $x=5$ , but not for any other  $x$  in I.

>

So what? It's not a counterexample

Since  $G$

$P \rightarrow G$  for any  $P$

.

---

- *References:*

Re: free variables in FOL

- ◆ *free variables in FOL*
  - ◇ *From: Ken Quirici*
- ◆ *Re: free variables in FOL*
  - ◇ *From: Jim Spriggs*
- ◆ *Re: free variables in FOL*
  - ◇ *From: Ken Quirici*
- ◆ *Re: free variables in FOL*
  - ◇ *From: Jim Spriggs*
- ◆ *Re: free variables in FOL*
  - ◇ *From: Ken Quirici*

- Prev by Date: *Re: Aristotelian syllogistic and monadic FOL*
- Next by Date: *Re: Did we really hope to get away with The Gödelian Argument?*
- Previous by thread: *Re: free variables in FOL*
- Next by thread: *Re: free variables in FOL*
- Index(es):
  - ◆ *Date*
  - ◆ *Thread*