

Re: Help with a problem

Source: <http://sci.tech--archive.net/Archive/sci.logic/2005-11/msg00650.html>

- *From:* Torkel Franzen <torkel@xxxxxxxxxx>
 - *Date:* 25 Nov 2005 13:38:22 +0100
-

"George Dance" <georgedance04@xxxxxxxxxx> writes:

> If one's aim is to use λ to formalize the inferences of informal
> reasoning, then a system like Copi's would work best.

A bizarre notion. The reasoning from "If r is positive, r is in E "
to "If r is positive and r is in S , r is in E " in the "elegant
and simple" derivation given by an unfortunate expert on Copi's system
goes

If r is positive, r is in E . So either if r is positive, r is in E ,
or r is not in S . So either r is not in S
or if r is positive, r is in E . So if r is in S , if
 r is positive, r is in E . So if r is in S and r is
positive, r is in E . So if r is positive and r is in S ,
 r is in E .

This bears no resemblance to any informal reasoning from "If r is
positive, r is in E " to "If r is positive and r is in S , r is in E "
found in nature.

.

- *Follow-Ups:*
 - ◆ ***Re: Help with a problem***
 - ◇ *From:* George Dance
 - ◆ ***Re: Help with a problem***
 - ◇ *From:* G . Frege
- *References:*
 - ◆ ***Help with a problem***
 - ◇ *From:* Robert Zimmerman
 - ◆ ***Re: Help with a problem***
 - ◇ *From:* Chris Menzel
 - ◆ ***Re: Help with a problem***
 - ◇ *From:* Robert Zimmerman
 - ◆ ***Re: Help with a problem***

Re: Help with a problem

◇ *From:* William Elliot

◆ ***Re: Help with a problem***

◇ *From:* William Elliot

◆ ***Re: Help with a problem***

◇ *From:* G . Frege

◆ ***Re: Help with a problem***

◇ *From:* George Dance

- Prev by Date: ***Re: Natural deduction?***
- Next by Date: ***Re: Natural deduction?***
- Previous by thread: ***Re: Help with a problem***
- Next by thread: ***Re: Help with a problem***
- Index(es):
 - ◆ ***Date***
 - ◆ ***Thread***