

Re: Penrose vs the Robot

Source: <http://sci.tech-archive.net/Archive/sci.logic/2005-11/msg00806.html>

- *From:* "Rupert" <rupertmccallum@xxxxxxxxxx>
 - *Date:* 29 Nov 2005 15:31:18 -0800
-

Daryl McCullough wrote:

> Rupert says...

>

>>Daryl McCullough wrote:

>

>>The reason Penrose can't star the sentence "Penrose will never star
>>this sentence" is because self-reference is involved; Penrose's
>>behaviour involves making a prediction about Penrose's behaviour.

>

> Yes, both Penrose' statement and the robot's statement are
> self-referential, in exactly the same way. Neither Penrose
> nor the robot is able to follow the rule that he star
> each and every sentence that he unassailably believes,
> and for exactly the same reason: it is inconsistent to
> do so.

>

>>In the case of the robot, the sentence is merely a statement about
>>numbers. So it looks like we need a different sort of explanation of
>>why the robot can't star the sentence.

>

> It doesn't look that way to me.

>

> Let G_R = "The robot will never star this sentence."

> Let G_P = "Penrose will never star this sentence."

>

> The explanation for why Penrose cannot star G_P is *exactly*
> the same for the explanation for why the robot cannot star
> G_R. In both cases, the person or robot can reason: If I
> star that sentence, I will have made the sentence false.

This seems to me to be questionable in the case where the sentence is a mathematical one. You can't make a mathematical sentence true or false, it just is true or false, regardless of what you do.

.

- *Follow-Ups:*
 - ◆ **Re: Penrose vs the Robot**
 - ◇ *From:* Daryl McCullough

- *References:*
 - ◆ **Penrose vs the Robot**
 - ◇ *From:* Daryl McCullough
 - ◆ **Re: Penrose vs the Robot**
 - ◇ *From:* Rupert
 - ◆ **Re: Penrose vs the Robot**
 - ◇ *From:* Daryl McCullough

- Prev by Date: **Re: What is the 1st order formal system known as PA?**
- Next by Date: **Re: Are Logicians Naturally Logical?**
- Previous by thread: **Re: Penrose vs the Robot**
- Next by thread: **Re: Penrose vs the Robot**
- Index(es):
 - ◆ **Date**
 - ◆ **Thread**