

Re: Question: Given $|X|>0$ and $|Y|>0$, can $X \times Y$ be empty?

Re: Question: Given $|X|>0$ and $|Y|>0$, can $X \times Y$ be empty?

Source: <http://sci.tech-archive.net/Archive/sci.logic/2007-08/msg00018.html>

- *From:* David C. Ullrich <ullrich@xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx>
 - *Date:* Thu, 02 Aug 2007 06:23:10 -0500
-

On Thu, 02 Aug 2007 00:37:37 -0000, Scott <ToaTerra@xxxxxxxxxx> wrote:

On Jul 31, 12:09 pm, magi...@xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx (Arturo Magidin) wrote:

In article <1185907968.957505.112...@xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx>,

Scott <ToaTe...@xxxxxxxxxx> wrote:

Hi:

I recently received a comment from someone that given $|X| > 0$ and $|Y|$

0 , $X \times Y$ can be empty.

Please provide a link to the original comment.

I'm afraid you have something of a track-record for misunderstanding comments.

So true. Let me gather my thoughts and then I'll post the proof in another thread. Then you can comment on why the other recipient states $X \times Y = 0$.

Actually he didn't ask you to gather your thoughts – the request was that you show us exactly what the comment said. Word for word.

The point being that what you say he said is obviously false. But there are various true statements that might sound a lot like the false statement that you claimed was said. So it could be that while the statement you posted is false, the actual

Re: Question: Given $|X|>0$ and $|Y|>0$, can $X \times Y$ be empty?

Re: Question: Given $|X|>0$ and $|Y|>0$, can $X \times Y$ be empty?

comment you saw was actually true.

One would think you'd want to find out whether that was what happened. But if we're going to find that out then having you gather your thoughts is no help – we need to see exactly what the comment said.

David C. Ullrich

.