

Re: Question: Given $|X|>0$ and $|Y|>0$, can $X \times Y$ be empty?

Re: Question: Given $|X|>0$ and $|Y|>0$, can $X \times Y$ be empty?

Source: <http://sci.tech-archive.net/Archive/sci.logic/2007-08/msg00162.html>

- *From:* george <greeneg@xxxxxxxxxxx>
 - *Date:* Thu, 09 Aug 2007 11:26:44 -0700
-

On Aug 2, 4:26 pm, Scott <ToaTe...@xxxxxxxxxxx> wrote:

Look, I think we've got off on the wrong foot. I asked a question, you wanted the link/quote, the link/quote was useless so I didn't post it and instead offered to post the context/proof in another thread (to avoid confusion with the title of this one), you declined, David asked for it too, I posted it, it was found useless,

It was not JUST found useless.

Somebody said that a set was empty.

You claimed that this somehow entitled you to lie (about that someone) that he had said that the cross-product of two non-empty sets was empty.

What you posted was useful in clarifying that, at least.

now you (maybe) want the proof.

An old proof (so old that you don't understand it) is of precious little

value to those of us who do. What you should've done was throw the Potter book away and just ask for a proof Cantor's Theorem.

If you do in fact already concede that that proof is valid, and, as you claim, you dispute only the "implicit assumptions", then you need to STATE at least ONE of those implicit assumptions EXplicitly.

You DO NOT need to tell us that you couldn't read somebody's criticism of something you emailed him that was incoherent to begin with.

Mis-communication to the extreme. I don't want to waste people's time...

Liar.

Re: Question: Given $|X|>0$ and $|Y|>0$, can $X \times Y$ be empty?

Re: Question: Given $|X|>0$ and $|Y|>0$, can $X \times Y$ be empty?

Starting again. Can $X \times Y = \text{emptyset}$ if $|X| > 0$ and $|Y| > 0$.

No.

A commenter said this is true in an email in response to proof I sent him to review.

No, he didn't.

Two people have provided proof that this is false. My question has been answered. Since people are concerned that I frequently mis-interpret things, I am grateful that you are willing to make sure I am not. Would you like the proof?

The proof OF WHAT?? WE certainly don't need to see a proof that $X \times Y$ empty implies that X is empty or Y is. Do you??

I appreciate everyone's comments even though I can be frustrating sometimes.

I'm doing my best to make that difficult. It's very hard to appreciate any comment to the effect that you are so bad at something that you should probably just quit. At a bare minimum you need to go back to some first lessons (in first-order logic) and STOP WORRYING ABOUT anything as complicated as Cantor's Theorem.

.

Re: Question: Given $|X|>0$ and $|Y|>0$, can $X \times Y$ be empty?