

Re: The king of france is ...

Source: <http://sci.tech-archive.net/Archive/sci.logic/2008-04/msg01249.html>

- *From:* Newberry <newberryxy@xxxxxxxxxx>
 - *Date:* Sat, 19 Apr 2008 21:29:09 -0700 (PDT)
-

On Apr 19, 8:05 pm, "Jesse F. Hughes" <je...@xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx> wrote:

Newberry <newberr...@xxxxxxxxxx> writes:

On Apr 19, 5:58 pm, "Jesse F. Hughes" <je...@xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx> wrote:

Newberry <newberr...@xxxxxxxxxx> writes:

Are you saying that the singular of "all the apples in my basket are red" = $(x)[Bx \rightarrow (Rx \ \& \ \sim(y)(By \rightarrow y=x))]$ is not

$$(x)[Bx \rightarrow (Rx \ \& \ (y)(By \rightarrow y=x))] \quad (5)$$

but

$$(Ex)[Bx \ \& \ Rx \ \& \ (y)(By \rightarrow y=x)] \quad (7)$$

?

I don't know what you mean by "the singular" of a sentence,

You should purchase a textbook of English grammar then. "All the apples in my basket are red" is in plural. "The apple in my basket is red" is in singular.

Re: The king of france is ...

It's terminology I'm not familiar with, but okay.

Hmm ...

[...]

Any suggestion for a better translation of "all the apples in my basket are red"?

$(\exists x)Bx \ \& \ (x)[Bx \rightarrow (Rx \ \& \ \sim(y)(By \rightarrow y=x))]$

perhaps?

That's fine. Another translation would be

$(x)(Bx \rightarrow Rx) \ \& \ (\exists x)(\exists y)(Bx \ \& \ By \ \& \ x \neq y)$

Every apple in the basket is red and there's more than one apple in the basket.

NOTE: It seems to me that the plain English sentence "all the apples in my basket are red" is true when there are no apples in the basket. I'm not convinced that we always interpret such sentences as having an implicit claim that there are more than one apple in my basket. But, insofar as that's how you want to interpret the sentence, either of the above will do.

Make up your mind. Either

A)

"the apple in my basket is red" = $(\exists x)(Bx \ \& \ Rx \ \& \ (y)(By \rightarrow y=x))$ and then

"all the apples in my basket are red" = $(\exists x)Bx \ \& \ (x)[Bx \rightarrow (Rx \ \& \ \sim(y)(By \rightarrow y=x))]$, or

B)

"the apple in my basket is red" = $(x)[Bx \rightarrow (Rx \ \& \ (y)(By \rightarrow y=x))]$

"all the apples in my basket are red" = $(x)[Bx \rightarrow (Rx \ \& \ \sim(y)(By \rightarrow y=x))]$ and

Re: The king of france is ...

Re: The king of france is ...

Which one is it?

.