

Re: The definite integral.

Source: <http://sci.tech-archive.net/Archive/sci.math/2005-03/5498.html>

From: David C. Ullrich (ullrich_at_math.okstate.edu)

Date: 03/16/05

Date: Wed, 16 Mar 2005 05:20:03 -0600

On 15 Mar 2005 19:13:47 -0800, "William Hughes"
<wpihughes@hotmail.com> wrote:

>
>David C. Ullrich wrote:
>
> <snip>
>
>
>> You've said a few times that one can prove ftc without mvt.
>> How do you do that? Without using mvt at any point in the
>> argument, I mean. (Like, the fact that $f' = 0$ implies f is
>> constant uses mvt, at least the obvious/standard proof does.)
>
>
>I am pretty sure I have seen an elegant proof of this, but
>I don't have a reference. Perhaps I dreamt it.
>
>However, one can always cheat.
>
>We only need mvt to show $f' = 0$ implies f constant.
>
>So let $f' = 0$ on (a,b) . Assume wlog that $f(0) = 0$.
>Assume that f is not constant. Then, there is some
> c in (a,b) with $f(c) \neq 0$. Draw the line from $(a,0)$ to
> $(c,f(c))$. Note that the slope of this line is not 0.
>Consider the case where the slope is positive.
>Assume that there is a point d in (a,c) with $f(x)$
>below the line. But now $f(x)$ must cross
>the line from below, or be below the line at c .
>Either leads to a contradiction.
>Assume therefore that $f(x)$ lies above the line.
>By continuity of f , there must be a point d in (a,c)
>such that $f(d) < f(c)/2$. Draw a new line from
> $(d,f(d))$ to $(c,f(c))$. This line also has positive
>slope and $f(x)$ must start out below it ($f'(d) = 0$).
>But this means that $f(x)$ must cross the second line from
>below, or be below the second line at c . Both

>lead to contradictions.
>The case for negative slope is similar.
>
>Not only is this as ugly as sin,

Yes,

>but it has the same
>"feel" as the usual proof of the mvt.

precisely. I didn't claim that it's necessary to actually prove mvt first – no theorem is ever necessary, you can always avoid using it by inserting the proof instead of citing the theorem.

>Still I can
>claim honour is satisfied.
>
>
> <snip>
>
> – William Hughes

David C. Ullrich