Re: 'Navie set theory': why when S(x) is (x = x), the specified x's do not constitue a set?

Source: http://sci.tech−archive.net/Archive/sci.math/2005−05/msg03992.html

---

- *From*: Dave Seaman <dseaman@xxxxxxxxxxxx>
- *Date*: Sat, 21 May 2005 21:35:15 +0000 (UTC)

On 21 May 2005 13:03:23 −0700, porky_pig_jr@xxxxxxxxxxx wrote:
> I"m reading 'Naive Set Theory' and the end of Section 3 there is a
> following sentence:

> [quote]
> In case S(x) is (x \notin x), or in case S(x) is (x = x), the specified
> x's do not constitute a set.
> [quote]

> The first one, (x \notin x) is Russell's Paradox, that one I
> understand. I"m not clear what's wrong with the second one, (x = x).
> Seems like this is tautology, always true. So if I have something like

> B = { x \in A : x = x }

> then B = A, since (x = x) is valid for all x's in A.

> I assume I'm missing something, but what?

There is a difference between

B = { x in A : x = x } (1)
and
B = { x : x = x } (2)

in that (1) always represents a set (for each choice of A), but (2) would
have to be the set of all sets, which does not exist in the kind of set
theory being discussed here.

−−
Dave Seaman
Judge Yohn's mistakes revealed in Mumia Abu−Jamal ruling.
<http://www.commoncouragepress.com/index.cfm?action=book&bookid=228>
.

- ***Follow−Ups***:
  - ***Re: 'Navie set theory': why when S(x) is (x = x), the specified x's do not constitue a set?***
    - ◊ *From:* porky_pig_jr@xxxxxxxxxxx
- ***References***:
  - ***'Navie set theory': why when S(x) is (x = x), the specified x's do not constitue a set?***
    - ◊ *From:* porky_pig_jr@xxxxxxxxxxx

- Prev by Date: ***Re: 'Navie set theory': why when S(x) is (x = x), the specified x's do not constitue a set?***
- Next by Date: ***Re: 'Navie set theory': why when S(x) is (x = x), the specified x's do not constitue a set?***
- Previous by thread: ***Re: 'Navie set theory': why when S(x) is (x = x), the specified x's do not constitue a set?***
- Next by thread: ***Re: 'Navie set theory': why when S(x) is (x = x), the specified x's do not constitue a set?***
- Index(es):
  - ***Date***
  - ***Thread***