

Re: what makes it true?

Source: <http://sci.tech-archive.net/Archive/sci.math/2005-09/msg01907.html>

- *From:* Torkel Franzen <torkel@xxxxxxxxxx>
 - *Date:* 08 Sep 2005 21:04:36 +0200
-

grubb@xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx (Daniel Grubb) writes:

> I can understand, given a formal system, whether I have a well formed
> formula, a proof, etc because I can apply whatever rules are given
> for forming formulae or for deriving new strings from the ones already
> obtained. However, without a set theory, I can't talk about the set of
> statements or prove anything about proofs. So my understanding of
> formal systems would be purely local if not for some type of set theory.

All of this sounds very strange. I don't see how it relates to anything that actually happens. To begin with, what do you mean by being given a formal system? In the real world, this means being given such explanations as "A \rightarrow (B \rightarrow A) is an axiom for all formulas A and B". We understand such explanations perfectly well without any set theory whatsoever, and I can't imagine by which procedure one would first introduce a set theory and then somehow use that set theory to elucidate the explanation.

.

- *Follow-Ups:*
 - ◆ *Re: what makes it true?*
 - ◇ *From:* Daniel Grubb
- *References:*
 - ◆ *what makes it true?*
 - ◇ *From:* lhlhsand
 - ◆ *Re: what makes it true?*
 - ◇ *From:*
 - ◆ *Re: what makes it true?*
 - ◇ *From:* Timothy Little
 - ◆ *Re: what makes it true?*
 - ◇ *From:*
 - ◆ *Re: what makes it true?*
 - ◇ *From:* Timothy Little
 - ◆ *Re: what makes it true?*
 - ◇ *From:* Torkel Franzen
 - ◆ *Re: what makes it true?*

Re: what makes it true?

◇ *From:* Timothy Little

◆ ***Re: what makes it true?***

◇ *From:* Torkel Franzen

◆ ***Re: what makes it true?***

◇ *From:* Daniel Grubb

◆ ***Re: what makes it true?***

◇ *From:* Torkel Franzen

◆ ***Re: what makes it true?***

◇ *From:* Daniel Grubb

◆ ***Re: what makes it true?***

◇ *From:* Daniel Grubb

- Prev by Date: ***Re: Bring Math Arguments against this FERMAT LAST THEOREM PROOF***
- Next by Date: ***Re: what makes it true?***
- Previous by thread: ***Re: what makes it true?***
- Next by thread: ***Re: what makes it true?***
- Index(es):
 - ◆ ***Date***
 - ◆ ***Thread***