

Re: Me and David C. Ullrich

Source: <http://sci.tech-archive.net/Archive/sci.math/2005-10/msg01246.html>

- *From:* "Randy Poe" <poespam-trap@xxxxxxxxxx>
 - *Date:* 12 Oct 2005 14:21:47 -0700
-

Jesse F. Hughes wrote:

> "Elmo" <elmoritz@xxxxxxxxxx> writes:
>
>> We can say:
>> 1. Two coins were flipped. We know because our statement told us so.
>> 2. All we know about the coin flip, we learned from the statement.
>> 3. We know that TT did not happen.
>> 4. We know that HH happened, and the statement was made, or, HT happened
>> and the statement was made, or, TH happened and the statement was made.
>> 5. Two coins were tossed is a statement of fact.
>> 6. "At least one is a head" is a conditional statement.
>
> I have held my tongue until now, but in what reasonable sense is "at
> least one is a head" a conditional statement? It is no less factual
> than "two coins were tossed."
>
> Utterly bizarre.
>
> Conditional statements are statements of the form: If X then Y. Or Y,
> given X. Or Y only if X. Or....
>
> "At least one is a head" is not a stinking conditional statement.

Eldon has been obsessing about this probability calculation for years.

See, for instance, this page from 1998:
<http://www.wiskit.com/marilyn/boys.html>

I think his answer would be something like "You don't know the conditions under which the person would tell you that at least one is a head. In the case HT/TH, they might be equally likely to say that one is a tail."

He has severe problems with the idea of "given" and insists on constructing elaborate behavioral scenarios involving the means by which you obtain the information that at least one is a head.

– Randy

- *Follow-Ups:*

- ◆ *Re: Me and David C. Ullrich*
◇ *From:* Elmo

- *References:*

- ◆ *Me and David C. Ullrich*
◇ *From:* Elmo
- ◆ *Re: Me and David C. Ullrich*
◇ *From:* Richard Tobin

- Prev by Date: *Re: CALCULUS HELP: How Am I Supposed To Come Up With This?*
- Next by Date: *Re: flush*
- Previous by thread: *Re: Me and David C. Ullrich*
- Next by thread: *Re: Me and David C. Ullrich*
- Index(es):
 - ◆ *Date*
 - ◆ *Thread*