

## Re: Me and David C. Ullrich

---

*Source:* <http://sci.tech-archive.net/Archive/sci.math/2005-10/msg01425.html>

---

- *From:* quasi <quasi@xxxxxxxx>
  - *Date:* Thu, 13 Oct 2005 23:42:34 -0700
- 

On 13 Oct 2005 18:36:51 -0700, "Elmo" <elmoritz@xxxxxxxx> wrote:

>  
>> >Would you like to define a proper experiment, or do you think that  
>> >there is no real experiment that would give the result that you claim  
>> >(or is there a 3rd option)?  
>>  
>> In a recent post in this thread, he did specify an experiment which  
>> forces the probability of 1/2, namely this one:  
>>  
>> A referee flips 2 coins.  
>>  
>> Based on the results (visible only to the ref), the ref makes one of  
>> the following 2 announcements:  
>>  
>> (1) there is a least one head  
>>  
>> (2) there is at least one tail  
>>  
>> In a case where either statement is possible, the ref picks one of the  
>> 2 announcements at random (equally likely).  
>>  
>> Based on the above experiment, if the ref announces "there is at least  
>> one head", then the probability of hh is clearly 1/2, not 1/3.  
>>  
>When the flipper flipped the coins, then looked, then chose heads, the  
>answer is 1/2.

Isn't that what I just said?

>> So the issue here is not a mathematical one, but one of language.  
>>  
>> I discussed this in a prior reply in this thread.  
>>  
>> If all you are told is "there is at least one head", and if the  
>> problem never mentions that there were other possible announcements,  
>> then you can't invent these other scenarios.  
>>  
>The coins landed HH and the statement was made, or the coins landed HT

Re: Me and David C. Ullrich

>and the statement was made, or the coins landed TH and the statement  
>was made.

I have no idea what you are saying in the above statement.

>Suppose that TH happened and the statement was made. The other  
>statement would have been true. You made a false statement, the flipper  
>wouldn't have had to invent the statement to have made it.

No, it's not the flipper (the ref) who I accused of inventing anything  
— I accused you. To my view, you are reading more into