

# JSH: Math as a religion

---

*Source:* <http://sci.tech-archive.net/Archive/sci.math/2006-01/msg04418.html>

---

- *From:* [jstevh@xxxxxxx](mailto:jstevh@xxxxxxx)
  - *Date:* 27 Jan 2006 07:14:40 -0800
- 

I'll give a simple example to explain how Galois Theory as used today is wrong, as consider a world where people don't take square roots for religious reasons. So on that world,  $\sqrt{4}$  is just  $\sqrt{4}$  as people refuse to take the square root.

On that world Galois Theory is used for ALL polynomials without regard to reducibility over  $\mathbb{Q}$  as people refuse to take square roots.

So consider

$$x^2 - 3x + 2 = 0$$

which you can solve on that world as they do have the quadratic formula:

$$x = (3 \pm \sqrt{4})/2$$

and they go on about the Galois Group and all kinds of stuff, and if you try to prove that only one of the roots has 2 as a factor, people get mad at you and start talking about definitions as they have defined everything and RIGOROUSLY use mathematics, except for this one quirk of refusing to take the square root—for religious reasons.

So you find a way to prove that only one of the roots has 2 as a factor by other means, which relies on the distributive property, and they get mad, but refuse to acknowledge the correct mathematics, what can you do?

You can't do anything as when math is a religion mathematical proof is as useless as facts are against religious people.

I have mathematical proof. I can show how it relies on the distributive property and put up the proof in a couple of paragraphs.

I used to get amazed when I'd step out the proof in extreme detail, and note that it relied on the distributive property and posters would claim it didn't!

So I'd explain how it did!

They'd claim it didn't!!!

Your mathematical society has failed.

You are no longer mathematicians or people really interested in mathematics, but just members of another religion and so, like people who are religious versus logical, you cannot be convinced by logical means.

So here we are, years after I showed the mathematics which shoots down current interpretations of Galois Theory and brings into question the theory of ideals you people still use the wrong ideas and still argue with me, as if I were debating fundamentalist Christians about the Flood.

If you use mathematics then it's clear I am correct.

If you use denial you can keep using mathematical ideas that don't actually work, but you can tell yourselves they work, like a freaking religion.

That mathematical ideas that are wrong are just wrong. They will not magically turn right.

James Harris

---

• ***Follow-Ups:***

- ◆ ***Re: JSH: Math as a religion***  
◇ *From: jstevh*
- ◆ ***Re: JSH: Math as a religion***  
◇ *From: Larry Lard*
- ◆ ***Re: Math as a religion***  
◇ *From: Boris Uon*

- Prev by Date: ***Re: A Basic Theorem***
- Next by Date: ***Re: A Basic Theorem***
- Previous by thread: ***Pi to 10 trillion places***
- Next by thread: ***Re: Math as a religion***
- Index(es):
  - ◆ ***Date***
  - ◆ ***Thread***