

Re: the need for relevance

Source: <http://sci.tech--archive.net/Archive/sci.math/2008-01/msg02106.html>

- *From:* Tonic <Tonicopm@xxxxxxxxxx>
 - *Date:* Tue, 15 Jan 2008 06:46:29 -0800 (PST)
-

On Jan 15, 4:25 pm, "Jesse F. Hughes" <je...@xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx> wrote:

Han de Bruijn <Han.deBru...@xxxxxxxxxxxxxxxx> writes:

It's so full of contradictions that I can't even start to mention them. But ah!! You call these contradictions: "counter intuitive results" ..

A contradiction is a theorem of the form "A & ~A". If you can show that ZFC proves such a theorem, then we would all agree that it is a contradiction.

But maybe you mean something else by the term "contradiction". Well, it's a bit bad form to redefine a term that already comes with a conventional meaning in the relevant context, but let's ignore that for now. Tell us: what do you mean when you use the term "contradiction", as when you say "ZFC is so full of contradictions..."?

*****8

For Mr. HdB, the (mathematical, to be sure) fact that there exists a bijection between the set of natural numbers and the set of even natural numbers, and thus BY DEFINITION both the set of natural numbers and the set of even natural numbers have the same cardinality, is a contradiction.

Why? Because HE KNOWS there are half as many even natural numbers as there are natural numbers! How does he know that? Who cares! He's said that anyone knows that, and thus it is so. Period.

Well, and what does this have to do with contradictions? The hell knows, but HdB, from his non-mathematical point of view (one can't blame him on this: he is not a mathematician, after all), has decided the above bijection is one. Period.

Well, and even assuming all that: then what?! Nothing, but HdB thinks

Re: the need for relevance

that since mathematicians get money to do their maths, then they MUST produce results that he and his friends can apply in what he has decided is "the real world". Why does he think so? I don't know, but this is one of the main points he has to attack, some times pretty viciously, though usually pretty ridiculously and even in a very funny way, mathematics and mathematicians.

So after all it is