

# Re: Twin Paradox Question

---

*Source:* <http://sci.tech-archive.net/Archive/sci.physics.relativity/2005-12/msg01329.html>

---

- *From:* "Sue..." <[suzysewnshow@xxxxxxxxxxxxx](mailto:suzysewnshow@xxxxxxxxxxxxx)>
  - *Date:* 15 Dec 2005 12:35:55 -0800
- 

Russell wrote:

> Sue... wrote:

>> Russell wrote:

>>> Sue... wrote:

>>>> Russell wrote:

>>>>> Sue... wrote:

>>>>>> Russell wrote:

>>>>>>> Sue... wrote:

>>>>>>>> Russell wrote:

>>>>>>>>> Sue... wrote:

>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>> [snip]

>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>>>> So... what do the Jovian moons appear to both observers

>>>>>>>>>>>> while all this hair is growing and greying?

>>>>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>>>>>> On the return trip, the youthful twin sees the moon zooming

>>>>>>>>>>>>>> at high speed around Jupiter. It makes up all of the orbits

>>>>>>>>>>>>>>> that failed to be seen on the outbound trip. The total counts

>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>> come out the same at the moment the twin gets home.

>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>> So if we use Jupiter's moons to measure his reading speed

>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>> he reads fast departing but slow returning.

>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>> If we use the \*received\* frequency of the moon's orbit, that is

>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>> correct. Note, in our usual time coordinates this frequency is

>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>> Doppler shifted, so just to be clear, let us say explicitly that

>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>> we make \*no\* compensation for Doppler.

>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>> We can do

>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>> the same for rate of hair growth.

>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>> Yes indeed.

>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>> You just defeated your own argument.

>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>

>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>> How so? Did you do the calculation?

>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>> Yeah the planet I was leaving was celebrating one birthday

Re: Twin Paradox Question

>>>>> for every two on the planet I was approaching. The  
>>>>> situation reversed on my return trip so everybody must have  
>>>>> had the number of birthdays.  
>>>>>  
>>>> Whoa, stick to your stupid units.  
>>>  
>>> [above sentence was written by me; Sue's quoting is wrong.]  
>>>  
>>>> No...  
>>>> It is too many millimeters close to lunch to do your maths for  
>>>> you.  
>>>  
>>> \*My\* maths? My maths is as explained in the FAQ, one page  
>>> of which Androcles so kindly posted here, with his oh-so-helpful  
>>> commentary. Everything I said here consistent with that page.  
>>> (Not with the commentary.)  
>>>  
>>> \*You\* claimed that I defeated my own argument, but when pressed  
>>> to justify this attack, you post a silly caricature of a "calculation"  
>>> that, as I correctly point out, in no way relates to our discussion.  
>>> I press you further and you run away for pizza. Disappointing.  
>>>  
>><<Well, perhaps you will get back to me after lunch. >>  
>> I will. Check the NG after about four furlongs. ;-)  
>  
> Well? You stood me up. Some possibilities:  
>  
<non physical possibilities snipped>

Sue...

.

- 
- **Follow-Ups:**
    - ◆ **Re: Twin Paradox Question**  
◇ From: Russell
  
  - **References:**
    - ◆ **Re: Twin Paradox Question**  
◇ From: Russell
    - ◆ **Re: Twin Paradox Question**  
◇ From: Black Knight
    - ◆ **Re: Twin Paradox Question**  
◇ From: Russell
    - ◆ **Re: Twin Paradox Question**  
◇ From: Sue...
    - ◆ **Re: Twin Paradox Question**  
◇ From: Russell

- ◆ **Re: Twin Paradox Question**  
◇ From: Sue...
- ◆ **Re: Twin Paradox Question**  
◇ From: Russell
- ◆ **Re: Twin Paradox Question**  
◇ From: Sue...
- ◆ **Re: Twin Paradox Question**  
◇ From: Russell
- ◆ **Re: Twin Paradox Question**  
◇ From: Sue...
- ◆ **Re: Twin Paradox Question**  
◇ From: Russell
- ◆ **Re: Twin Paradox Question**  
◇ From: Sue...
- ◆ **Re: Twin Paradox Question**  
◇ From: Russell
- ◆ **Re: Twin Paradox Question**  
◇ From: Sue...
- ◆ **Re: Twin Paradox Question**  
◇ From: Russell

- Prev by Date: **Re: "A Snapshot of a Photon"**
- Next by Date: **Re: Dayton Miller's Data have no Real Signal**
- Previous by thread: **Re: Twin Paradox Question**
- Next by thread: **Re: Twin Paradox Question**
- Index(es):
  - ◆ **Date**
  - ◆ **Thread**