Re: The Trouble with Physic(ist)s is that they are Not Even Wrong

Source: http://sci.tech−archive.net/Archive/sci.physics.relativity/2006−09/msg00663.html

- *From*: "JanPB" <filmart@xxxxxxxxx>
- *Date*: 4 Sep 2006 15:35:19 −0700

Tom Roberts wrote:

> LEJ Brouwer wrote:
>
> > I 'know' that the Schwarzschild
> > solution is wrong, and I also 'know' that my proposal must be either
> > correct, or if not completely correct at least on the right path.
>
> The rest of us want to do physics, not whatever it is you are trying to
> do. What God told you this? Why do you attempt to discuss such divine
> revelations in a physics newsgroup?
>
> > I
> > can't tell you precisely how I know − it is just a very strong gut
> > feeling, and when I feel like this, I am usually right.
>
> Here all you've shown is that you do not understand the MANY papers and
> books that have been written about this. You merely re−hash old
> objections long refuted, and old mistakes long corrected.
>
> > I actually admire you a great deal. You are like a walking
> > encyclopaedia on gravity, yet you do not appear to be at all
> > pretentious or arrogant about it.
>
> Yes, Steve Carlip is all of that.
>
> > BTW, could you please explain what you mean when you say that my
> > infinite cone has an 'edge'?

> I assume you mean your attempt to glue the two exterior regions of the Kruskal manifold together. The "edge" occurs when one follows an infalling timelike geodesic −− when it reaches r=2M all of a sudden it is impossible to compute the geodesic, because the metric is not C^2 there. Steve implied there is a boundary there, but I believe this can be done such that the manifold is continuous there, just not smooth.

I think the manifold can be glued smoothly (one can write down a smooth atlas on the quotient manifold) − it's the metric that has a "crease" at the glued horizon. I posted an outline of an argument few minutes ago. The problem is essentially with the Kruskal−Szekeres function r(T,X) (the one given by the usual implicit equation) − it has a nonzero slope at the horizon which would "crease" the metric there when glued.

−−
Jan Bielawski

.