

# A theoretical physics FAQ

---

*Source:* <http://sci.tech-archive.net/Archive/sci.physics.research/2006-01/msg00031.html>

---

- *From:* Arnold Neumaier <[Arnold.Neumaier@xxxxxxxxxxxxx](mailto:Arnold.Neumaier@xxxxxxxxxxxxx)>
  - *Date:* Fri, 6 Jan 2006 16:40:58 +0000 (UTC)
- 

A theoretical physics FAQ

<http://www.mat.univie.ac.at/~neum/physics-faq.txt>

This site contains answers to some more or less frequently asked questions from theoretical physics. They were edited from my answers to postings to the moderated newsgroup sci.physics.research (or, for some, to the unmoderated newsgroup de.sci.physik).

If you like the FAQ and/or found it useful, I'd appreciate if you link to it from your home page to make it more widely known.

If you spot errors or have suggestions for improvements, please write me (at [Arnold.Neumaier@xxxxxxxxxxxxx](mailto:Arnold.Neumaier@xxxxxxxxxxxxx)).

Compared to the version of June 20, 2005, there are only three new topics (as well as a number of minor improvements to older entries):

- S13f. Objective probabilities
- S16h. Modeling reality
- S16i. What is a system (e.g., an ideal gas)?

(This lack of growth is due to the fact that I currently have almost no free time for discussing physics. I apologize to those I had left with half-finished discussions, in particular to Seratend - hope to continue at some time in the future...)

Happy Reading!

# A theoretical physics FAQ

Arnold Neumaier  
University of Vienna  
<http://www.mat.univie.ac.at/~neum/>  
I like to see people grow

-----  
Table of Contents  
-----

QM = quantum mechanics, QFT = quantum field theory,  
QED = quantum electrodynamics, CCR = canonical commutation relations,

- S1a. What are bras and kets?
- S1b. Projective geometry and quantum mechanics
- S1c. What is the meaning of the entries of a density matrix?
- S1d. Postulates for the formal core of quantum mechanics
- S1e. Open quantum systems
- S1f. Interaction with a heat bath
- S1g. Quantum-classical correspondence
- S1h. Can all quantum states be realized in nature?
  
- S2a. Lie groups and Lie algebras
- S2b. The Galilei group as contraction of the Poincare group
- S2c. Representations of the Poincare group, spin and gauge invariance
- S2d. Forms of relativistic dynamics
- S2e. Is there a multiparticle relativistic quantum mechanics?
- S2f. Localization and position operators
  
- S3a. What are 'bare' and 'dressed' particles?
- S3b. How meaningful are single Feynman diagrams?
- S3c. How real are 'virtual particles'?
- S3d. What is the meaning of 'on-shell' and 'off-shell'?
- S3e. Virtual particles and Coulomb interaction
- S3f. Are virtual particles and decaying particles the same?
  
- S4a. Are electrons pointlike/structureless?
- S4b. How much information is in a particle?
- S4c. How real is the wave function?
- S4d. How real are Feynman's paths?
- S4e. Can particles go backward in time?
- S4f. What about particles faster than light
  
- S5a. QM pictures and representations

## A theoretical physics FAQ

- S5b. Inequivalent representations of the CCR/CAR
  - S5c. Why does QFT look so different from QM?
  - S5d. Why is QFT based on a classical action?
  - S5e. Why does the action only contain first derivatives?
  - S5f. Why normal ordering?
  - S5g. Why locality and causal commutation relations?
  - S5h. Creation operators and rigged Hilbert space
- 
- S6a. Nonperturbative computations in QFT
  - S6b. The formal functional integral approach to QFT
  - S6c. Functional integrals, Wightman functions, and rigorous QFT
  - S6d. Is there a rigorous interacting QFT in 4 dimensions?
  - S6e. The classical limit of relativistic QFT
  - S6f. What are interpolating fields?
- 
- S7a. What is the mass gap?
  - S7b. Why can a bound state of massless quarks be heavy?
  - S7c. Bound states in relativistic QFT
- 
- S8a. Why renormalization?
  - S8b. Renormalization without infinities I
  - S8c. Renormalization without infinities II
  - S8d. Renormalization and coarse graining
  - S8e. Renormalization scale and experimental energy scale
  - S8f. Dimensional regularization
  - S8g. Nonrelativistic quantum field theory
  - S8h. Nonrenormalizable theories as effective theories
  - S8i. What about infrared divergences?
- 
- S9a. Summing divergent series
  - S9b. Is QED consistent?
  - S9c. What about relativistic QFT at finite times?
  - S9d. Perturbation theory and instantaneous forces
  - S9e. QED and relativistic quantum chemistry
- 
- S10a. How are matrices and tensors related?
  - S10b. Is quantum mechanics compatible with general relativity?
  - S10c. Difficulties in quantizing gravity
  - S10d. Renormalization in quantum gravity
  - S10e. Hadamard states and their Hilbert spaces
  - S10f. Why do gravitons have spin 2?
  - S10g. What is the tetrad formalism?
  - S10h. Energy in general relativity
  - S10i. What happened to the ether?
  - S10j. What is time?

## A theoretical physics FAQ

- S11a. A concise formulation of the measurement problem of QM
- S11b. The double slit experiment
- S11c. The Stern-Gerlach experiment
- S11d. The minimal interpretation
- S11e. The preferred basis problem
- S11f. Master equation and pointer variables
- S11g. Does decoherence solve the measurement problem?
  
- S12a. Which interpretation of quantum mechanics is most consistent?
- S12b. Which textbook of quantum mechanics is best for foundations?
- S12c. What is the role of quantum logic?
- S12d. Stochastic quantum mechanics
- S12e. Is there a relativistic measurement theory?
  
- S13a. Random numbers and other random objects
- S13b. What is the meaning of probabilities?
- S13c. What about the subjective interpretation of probabilities?
- S13d. Are probabilities limits of relative frequencies?
- S13e. How meaningful are probabilities of single events?
- S13f. Objective probabilities
- S13g. How probable are realizations of stochastic processes?
- S13h. How do probabilities apply in practice?
- S13i. Incomplete knowledge and statistics
- S13j. Priors and entropy in probability theory
  
- S14a. Theoretical challenges close to experimental data
- S14b. Does the standard model predict chemistry?
- S14c. Is the result of a measurement a real number?
- S14d. Why use complex numbers in physics?
  
- S15a. How precise can physical language be?
- S15b. Why bother about rigor in physics?
- S15c. Justifying the foundations of a theory
- S15d. Foundations, theory and experiment
  
- S16a. On progress in science
- S16b. How different are physical sciences and social sciences
- S16c. Can good theories be falsified?
- S16d. What, then, distinguishes a good theory?
- S16e. When is a theory preferred to another one?
- S16f. What is a fact?
- S16g. Physics and experience
- S16h. Modeling reality
- S16i. What is a system (e.g., an ideal gas)?
  
- S17a. How to get information from sci.physics.research

## A theoretical physics FAQ

S17b. How to get your work published  
S17c. How to sell your revolutionary idea  
S17d. Useful background for theoretical physics  
S17e. Stories about physicists  
S17f. Other physics FAQs

S18a. What is the meaning of 'self-consistent'?  
S18b. What is a vector?  
S18c. Learning quantum mechanics at age 14

S19a. Acknowledgments

## A theoretical physics FAQ

<http://www.mat.univie.ac.at/~neum/physics-faq.txt>

This site contains answers to some more or less frequently asked questions from theoretical physics. They were edited from my answers to postings to the moderated newsgroup sci.physics.research (or, for some, to the unmoderated newsgroup de.sci.physik).

If you like the FAQ and/or found it useful, I'd appreciate if you link to it from your home page to make it more widely known.

If you spot errors or have suggestions for improvements, please write me (at Arnold.Neumaier@xxxxxxxxxxxxxx).

Compared to the version of June 20, 2005, there are only three new topics (as well as a number of minor improvements to older entries):

S13f. Objective probabilities

## A theoretical physics FAQ

S16h. Modeling reality

S16i. What is a system (e.g., an ideal gas)?

(This lack of growth is due to the fact that I currently have almost no free time for discussing physics. I apologize to those I had left with half-finished discussions, in particular to Seratend - hope to continue at some time in the future...)

Happy Reading!

Arnold Neumaier  
University of Vienna  
<http://www.mat.univie.ac.at/~neum/>  
I like to see people grow

-----  
Table of Contents  
-----

QM = quantum mechanics, QFT = quantum field theory,  
QED = quantum electrodynamics, CCR = canonical commutation relations,

- S1a. What are bras and kets?
- S1b. Projective geometry and quantum mechanics
- S1c. What is the meaning of the entries of a density matrix?
- S1d. Postulates for the formal core of quantum mechanics
- S1e. Open quantum systems
- S1f. Interaction with a heat bath
- S1g. Quantum-classical correspondence
- S1h. Can all quantum states be realized in nature?
  
- S2a. Lie groups and Lie algebras
- S2b. The Galilei group as contraction of the Poincare group
- S2c. Representations of the Poincare group, spin and gauge invariance
- S2d. Forms of relativistic dynamics
- S2e. Is there a multiparticle relativistic quantum mechanics?
- S2f. Localization and position operators
  
- S3a. What are 'bare' and 'dressed' particles?
- S3b. How meaningful are single Feynman diagrams?
- S3c. How real are 'virtual particles'?
- S3d. What is the meaning of 'on-shell' and 'off-shell'?
- S3e. Virtual particles and Coulomb interaction

## A theoretical physics FAQ

S3f. Are virtual particles and decaying particles the same?

- S4a. Are electrons pointlike/structureless?
- S4b. How much information is in a particle?
- S4c. How real is the wave function?
- S4d. How real are Feynman's paths?
- S4e. Can particles go backward in time?
- S4f. What about particles faster than light

- S5a. QM pictures and representations
- S5b. Inequivalent representations of the CCR/CAR
- S5c. Why does QFT look so different from QM?
- S5d. Why is QFT based on a classical action?
- S5e. Why does the action only contain first derivatives?
- S5f. Why normal ordering?
- S5g. Why locality and causal commutation relations?
- S5h. Creation operators and rigged Hilbert space

- S6a. Nonperturbative computations in QFT
- S6b. The formal functional integral approach to QFT
- S6c. Functional integrals, Wightman functions, and rigorous QFT
- S6d. Is there a rigorous interacting QFT in 4 dimensions?
- S6e. The classical limit of relativistic QFT
- S6f. What are interpolating fields?

- S7a. What is the mass gap?
- S7b. Why can a bound state of massless quarks be heavy?
- S7c. Bound states in relativistic QFT

- S8a. Why renormalization?
- S8b. Renormalization without infinities I
- S8c. Renormalization without infinities II
- S8d. Renormalization and coarse graining
- S8e. Renormalization scale and experimental energy scale
- S8f. Dimensional regularization
- S8g. Nonrelativistic quantum field theory
- S8h. Nonrenormalizable theories as effective theories
- S8i. What about infrared divergences?

- S9a. Summing divergent series
- S9b. Is QED consistent?
- S9c. What about relativistic QFT at finite times?
- S9d. Perturbation theory and instantaneous forces
- S9e. QED and relativistic quantum chemistry

## A theoretical physics FAQ

- S10a. How are matrices and tensors related?
  - S10b. Is quantum mechanics compatible with general relativity?
  - S10c. Difficulties in quantizing gravity
  - S10d. Renormalization in quantum gravity
  - S10e. Hadamard states and their Hilbert spaces
  - S10f. Why do gravitons have spin 2?
  - S10g. What is the tetrad formalism?
  - S10h. Energy in general relativity
  - S10i. What happened to the ether?
  - S10j. What is time?
- 
- S11a. A concise formulation of the measurement problem of QM
  - S11b. The double slit experiment
  - S11c. The Stern-Gerlach experiment
  - S11d. The minimal interpretation
  - S11e. The preferred basis problem
  - S11f. Master equation and pointer variables
  - S11g. Does decoherence solve the measurement problem?
- 
- S12a. Which interpretation of quantum mechanics is most consistent?
  - S12b. Which textbook of quantum mechanics is best for foundations?
  - S12c. What is the role of quantum logic?
  - S12d. Stochastic quantum mechanics
  - S12e. Is there a relativistic measurement theory?
- 
- S13a. Random numbers and other random objects
  - S13b. What is the meaning of probabilities?
  - S13c. What about the subjective interpretation of probabilities?
  - S13d. Are probabilities limits of relative frequencies?
  - S13e. How meaningful are probabilities of single events?
  - S13f. Objective probabilities
  - S13g. How probable are realizations of stochastic processes?
  - S13h. How do probabilities apply in practice?
  - S13i. Incomplete knowledge and statistics
  - S13j. Priors and entropy in probability theory
- 
- S14a. Theoretical challenges close to experimental data
  - S14b. Does the standard model predict chemistry?
  - S14c. Is the result of a measurement a real number?
  - S14d. Why use complex numbers in physics?
- 
- S15a. How precise can physical language be?
  - S15b. Why bother about rigor in physics?
  - S15c. Justifying the foundations of a theory
  - S15d. Foundations, theory and experiment

## A theoretical physics FAQ

- S16a. On progress in science
- S16b. How different are physical sciences and social sciences
- S16c. Can good theories be falsified?
- S16d. What, then, distinguishes a good theory?
- S16e. When is a theory preferred to another one?
- S16f. What is a fact?
- S16g. Physics and experience
- S16h. Modeling reality
- S16i. What is a system (e.g., an ideal gas)?

- S17a. How to get information from sci.physics.research
- S17b. How to get your work published
- S17c. How to sell your revolutionary idea
- S17d. Useful background for theoretical physics
- S17e. Stories about physicists
- S17f. Other physics FAQs

- S18a. What is the meaning of 'self-consistent'?
- S18b. What is a vector?
- S18c. Learning quantum mechanics at age 14

- S19a. Acknowledgments