

## Re: Beethoven's 5th Symphony

**Source:** <http://sci.tech-archive.net/Archive/sci.physics/2005-02/2494.html>

---

**From:** Uncle Al (*UncleAl0\_at\_hate.spam.net*)

**Date:** 02/05/05

Date: Sat, 05 Feb 2005 14:33:50 -0800

"Peter H.M. Brooks" wrote:

>

> *Uncle Al wrote:*

> > *"Peter H.M. Brooks" wrote:*

> >

> > > *I'm working on a little personal project. I'd like to get a better*

> > > *understanding of Beethoven's 5th Symphony.*

> >

> > *[snip]*

> >

> >

> > > *This may seem a silly question, but I'll ask it anyway. What is the best*

> > > *way to come to a musical understanding of a work of this magnitude, both*

> > > *musically and historically – given that it is probably my favourite work*

> > > *of classical music already?*

> >

> > *[snip]*

> >

> > *Since your enquiry is not into objective reality, any answer is both*

> > *correct and incorrect. It is only a matter of how loud you shout, how*

> > *well you seduce, or who can hook on and gain advantage. Any system*

> > *that admits John Cage and Jackson "Jack the Dripper" Pollock is*

> > *corrupt and meaningless.*

> >

> *To call meaning, no matter how corrupt, 'meaningless' is to corrupt the*

> *meaning of meaning.*

If it doesn't reduce to a predictive mathematical model falsifiable by observation, it is arbitrary. If it is arbitrary it has no intrinsic meaning. Aesthetics are meaningless. They are a peer vote amongst posseurs.

I like my women smooth. That would not be a commensalist aesthetic in any Mediterranean country France through Italy to Greece. If I disliked shrill dissonances I would loathe Orientalist music starting in Eastern Europe (abused clarinets) and throughout Asia. If redheads were my thing I would be confined to Irish, Scottish, Dutch, and some

## sci.physics: Re: Beethoven's 5th Symphony

Northern Italians. Whether a huge-butted peppercorn-headed stout African is prettier than a slim tall fair Englishwoman is without any meaning at all. If you want surviving kids when the food supply is chancey, you definitely want the porker over the empty larder.

> *I know that answers will differ. It is, I hope, fairly obvious that I'm not looking for any post-modernist bullshit as an answer. However, to claim that simply because post-modernist bullshit exists the whole of meaning and aesthetics have gone for a ball of shit is nonsense.*

Nope. It is an aesthetic call. It has no basis in reality. People eat – by choice – Brussels sprouts, pickled beets, tofu, natto, bran... De gustibus non est disputandum. Walking through an Oriental market is a tummy tosser. Yet an East Indian would not feast on a fine ribeye steak, a Jew would eschew a pork roast, Orientals do not tolerate dairy products, and both Chinese and Koreans fancy eating dog (possibly the only thing they agree upon other than hating Japanese).

> *Sensible and clever people still exist. Post-modernism is only there for lazy proles – and lazy proles have always had something to bolster their fragile egos, if only gin.*

When you have no uniform system of weights and measures any number is correct. Was Picasso a great artist? His Blue Period (courtesy of A French industrialist who synthesized ultramarine, thus also kicking off Impressionism) shows he could put it on canvas. Jackson Pollock was a failed housepainter with a quick mouth who filled a need for product.

> *Aesthetics is still an important study carried out by clever, erudite and well informed people.*

Nonsense. It is nothing deeper than cultural bias. The standard of aesthetic excellence is something that can be acquired by not too many and not without great cost. Frank Gehry's museum in Bilbao, Spain is OK once. His Disney Hall is within driving distance of me. Two of those buildings constitute one too many. He has erected that visual horror all over the Earth. One Sidney, Australia opera House is OK. Two would be excessive. The Liberal and Fine Arts are at best personal bias and usually manipulated value for tax avoidance. 90% of either's accumulated content is generally crap by any objective standard.

> *Mc\$hite didn't destroy haute cuisine – even if most proles don't know that.*

Table with small hole at center. Monkey's head protrudes. Guests whang monkey's head with small mallets, reflect the scalp, then dip past the fractured skull into the still living brain with small-bowled long-handled spoons. Yum. How much haute can you stand? I find bleu cheese to be utterly disgusting, yet I enjoy pickled herring in cream sauce with raw onions.

sci.physics: Re: Beethoven's 5th Symphony

Do what you want. If it attracts a mob – in black tie or in sneakers  
– you're in.

For all that, classicism and romantism disgorged great music and  
nigger noise does not.

--

Uncle Al

<http://www.mazepath.com/uncleal/>

(Toxic URL! Unsafe for children and most mammals)

<http://www.mazepath.com/uncleal/qz.pdf>